Contents

Diversity of Interpretations Regarding Qawwam in Islamic Thought with Special Reference to Surah An-Nisa  
Muhammad Zaheer Abbas  
Shamreeza Riaz  
01

A Comprehension of Zarruq’s of Qawaid al-Tasawwuf  
Ghulam Shams-ur-Rehman  
21

Religious Locale and Inter-Religions Demographic Structure of Colonial Multan  
Muhammad Shafique  
Muhammad Javed Akhtar  
Lubna Kanwal  
45

The Identity Crisis Muslim State of Pakistan: A Historical Analysis and Future Prospects  
Muhammad Mumtraz Khan  
Rehan Iqbal  
Muhammad Farooq  
59
Does Religious Capital Transmit Across the Generations? A
Gender Based Evidence from Multan District

Fareed Shareef

Imran Sharif Chaudhary

Toseef Azid
Diversity of Interpretations Regarding \textit{Qawwam} in Islamic Thought with Special Reference to Surah An-Nisa

*Muhammad Zaheer Abbas  
**Shamreeza Riaz

\textit{Abstract}

Islam has granted fundamental rights to women, however, they are not interpreted accurately in our society due to the existence of a patriarchal social setup. The root cause of denying women rights is lack of command of Islamic teachings. There are many misconceptions regarding the stance of Islam on women rights especially on men and women equal social, legal and moral status as human beings. Islam differentiates between their status, roles and responsibilities in the family system, based on equity and justice. However, the true spirit of role differentiation is misunderstood by non Muslims as well as by less educated Muslims as establishing the patriarchal system endorsing gender inequality and discrimination against women. This article will highlight social concerns about women rights and responsibilities. Moreover, it will highlight the areas of tension among four schools of thought regarding superiority of men. The thrust of the article is that the intention of the Quran is to raise the status of women in society, not to relegate them to subordination as is commonly believed and practiced in much of the Muslim world today.

\textbf{Key Words:} Qawwam, Surah An-Nisa, Shariah Compatibility, Superiority of man, patriarchal social system, Diversity of Interpretations.
I- Introduction

Marriage is highly revered and extolled in Islam and accorded a detailed treatment both in the Quran and the Sunnah of the Holy Prophet (PBUH). It is, for instance, called as the sign of God,\(^1\) a way of Prophets\(^2\) and the Sunnah of Holy Prophet (PBUH)\(^3\). Quran describes marriage as a sacred covenant\(^4\) and uses the simile of a garment\(^5\) to describe the unique relationship between husband and wife and asks both the partners to be very kind and respectable to each other. Family, the basic and most important unit of any society is considered a divine establishment since the times of the first couple of Adam and Eve. Considering its importance, Islam has laid down a set of principles for its formation. Nikah\(^6\), between a male and a female is considered to be the most important prerequisite with zero tolerance for any sort of extra marital relations before or after marriage, declaring it a culpable crime.\(^7\)

The issue, of rights and responsibilities of the husband and wife, has become a separate category of analysis in recent scholarship of human rights. Proper contextual interpretation of the Quran can achieve compatibility with the standards of contemporary human rights. For the smooth functioning of the family, Allah has distributed rights and responsibilities on the basis of equity and justice. Man has been given the status of the caretaker, while woman is regarded as the centre of the family. In the status of caretaker and maintainer, man has been given the sole responsibility of earning for the family, exempting woman from any kind of economic liability for herself or the family. Islamic law secures her financial rights in the family setup through her right of dower, inheritance and maintenance for her as well as for her children. Still she can enter any lawful profession or business if she requires or desires so, provided that her primary responsibilities of motherhood and as guardian of her house are not totally negated or undermined by her working outside.

II- Position of Woman in Family Sphere

There are many misconceptions regarding the position of woman in family sphere. Many critics have raised the question that whether or not a woman has been granted a secondary or lower position in Islam with a superior status for men? On contrary to the perceived misconception of the religion enforcing gender inequality, the equality, freedom and dignity that Islam offers to woman remains unparalleled in the history. Islam proclaims woman not only equal to man but in some respects gives her more importance. In Islam, equality is considered different from sameness and being identical, hence, it differentiates between the roles of men and women that they are expected to play in the family and society. Moreover, despite recognizing the empirical differences between the genders, it never uses these differences as measuring tool for their success.\(^8\) Feminist approach considers patriarchal set up of family, with the husband head of the family, generating stereo typed roles to be the main cause of the violation of women’s rights. According to them, this attitude is
extended in the wider social roles resulting in the patriarchal structure of the entire society.

They base their views on Quranic verse 4:34; it depicts male superiority but in no way advocates male domination. However, unfortunately later developments imposed male domination violating the true Islamic spirit. It should be clearly understood, at this point, that by identifying man as the head of the family, Islam has neither established nor endorsed patriarchal mind set or attitudes. With all the instruction for males to be kind and caring to their wives, in Islamic model of family, Holy Prophet (PBUH) himself is seen trying to please and comfort his wives as much as they are trying to please and comfort him. In doing so he (PBUH) occasionally joins them in household chores in appreciation of their domestic role, as well. Holy Prophet (PBUH) not only established woman’s status and her rights practically in the society, but enjoined the protection of these rights as an integral part of manifestation of faith, indicators of positive social behaviors and rules of legal system.

In Islamic social scheme, everyone moves within the circle of rights and obligations as mentioned in one tradition of Holy Prophet (PBUH): “All of you are guardians and responsible for your wards. The ruler is a guardian and the man is a guardian of his family; the wife is a guardian and is responsible for her husband’s house and his off springs; so all of you are guardians and responsible for your wards”. This tradition uses the words “guardian” and “responsible” for both genders and it only illustrates a separation of powers in one’s own sphere for the better management of the house. The Quran also lays down that men and women are equally responsible for their actions: “[e]very soul will be held in pledge for its deeds”. In this verse, word soul is used which is sexless and reflects complete gender neutrality. The Quran specifies only one criterion for distinguishing between human beings, namely righteousness “And to all are (assigned) degrees according to the deeds which they (have done), and in order that (Allah) may recompense their deeds, and no injustice be done to them”. These verses demonstrate that the Quran guarantees equal rights to men and women.

III- Patriarchal Interpretation of the Quran

As demonstrated above in general terms that everyone has rights and duties which must be fulfilled. Men are physically strong and they are supposed to perform different roles outdoors as head of family. Indoors women bear, deliver and nurture the child. Still they are considered weak and are supposed to remain within the confines of their home in one way or the other. Alternatively, does the Quran advocate gender distinction, dualisms, or inequality on the basis of sexual (biological) differences? In other words, does it privilege men over women in their biological capacity as males, or treat men as the self (normative) and women as the other, or view women and men as binary opposites, as modern patriarchal theories of sexual differentiation and inequality do? Islam gives equal rights to both genders and it recognizes the position of women to be the same as of men. There is no discrimination found on the biological basis in Islam. Many scholars believed that
there is no biological difference whereas other are of the view that Islam is a practical religion and it takes into account physical differences between men and women.\textsuperscript{16}

If it looks unfair to some people then what about the saying of the Holy Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) that each day of a woman’s pregnancy is rewarded as if she had fasted all day and prayed all night\textsuperscript{17}. Hadith also refers that bearing of a child is rewarded by God in the same way as if she had performed an acceptable Hajj. Many people perform Hajj but everyone’s Hajj is not acknowledged by Allah SWT. Men cannot be rewarded in this way because, obviously, men cannot entertain these privileges. So this is unfair because men are physically unable to get reward in this way. Hadith says that heaven or paradise lies under the feet of the mother, so one could think of gender discrimination again. But this is simple recognition of the physical difference between men and women.

A belief exists among Muslim scholars that men are superior in intellect and other abilities, as women are dependent in decision making and financial matters so women are expected to be obedient and follow their husband as the verse goes on to say “Therefore the righteous women are devoutly obedient”\textsuperscript{18}. Sometime the word “obedient” is misunderstood or mistranslated to mean, as good women are obedient to their husband. But in the phrase, “obedience” is with reference to obey God’s instructions and commands. It can be argued that men are the maintainers of women because they are incharge of the family and support it financially. Thus, they would demand their wives to obey them unquestionably. But here, Allah SWT is telling them that unquestioning obedience is due to God only, and not to their husband. It does not mean to say that wives should not listen or discuss things with their husbands. Simply the verse means that if there is a contradiction between command of Allah SWT and that of Husband, then wife is ordered to follow Almighty’s orders. At another place, Allah SWT says “guarding the unseen as Allah has guarded” which means that a wife should guard and protect her husband’s rights in the same way as Allah SWT has protected women’s rights.\textsuperscript{19}

\textbf{IV- Interpretative Tensions among Modernist and Traditionalist}

Allah SWT has discussed feminine issues in Quran at various places, particularly in a separate chapter of Quran titled as An Nisa, the women. It discusses issues like gender equality, polygamy, inheritance rights of women, \textit{mahr}, dower and divorce. However, certain verses have been interpreted in a fashion against women’s equal rights, reducing women to a disadvantaged group. The verse on \textit{qawwam} is one of them. There are some inherent tensions existing in traditionalists and modernists interpretative approaches to the concept of \textit{qawwam}. In this article, it is intended to highlight some of the tensions which emerge due to different constructions of the above mentioned verse in traditionalists and modernists interpretations.

There is no agreed way of classifying interpreters into traditionalist and modernists’ camp. In the article, the term traditionalist refers to interpretative views
Diversity of Interpretations Regarding *qawwam* in Islamic Thought with Special Reference to Surah An-Nisa

of earlier scholars, Al Razi\(^{20}\), Abu Bakar Ibnul Arabi\(^{21}\), Qurtabi \(^{22}\) and Imam Abu Bakar Al-Jasas \(^{23}\) as well as the views of 20\(^{th}\) century scholars, modernists, such as Al-Hakeem Al-Sheikh Tantawi, Daryabadi, Al Turabi, Abdullah Yusuf Ali\(^{24}\), Abul A’la Maududi\(^ {25}\), Sayyid Qutb\(^ {26}\), Tahira Saffardzadeh, La’l Muhammad Chawla, Javed Ahmed Ghamidi and Mohammed Shafi’i. Whereas, to know the teachings of the Holy Prophet, Sahih Bukhari, Muslim, Abu Dawud, Tirmazi, Ibn-e-Maja and Bayhaqi are quoted to support Islamic teachings on the concerned issue. A family, like a small state, requires a ruler for its establishment and survival. Either the husband or the wife has to take charge of all responsibilities of institutions of family. The Quran informs us that the husband has been entrusted with the responsibility.\(^{27}\) The position of husband in family sphere is established by the following verse of the Quran, “Men are the (*qawwamun*) protectors and maintainers of women, because Allah has given the one more (strength) than the other, and because they support them from their means”\(^ {28}\). The word *qawwamun*, and the verse as a whole, are subject to different interpretations. Traditional scholars translate *qawwamun* as ruler or one in charge, while some scholars understand *qawwamun* as meaning protector and maintainer. Different interpretations of word *qawwamun* will be discussed in next part of this article.

This Divine verse describes the man as *qawwam*\(^ {29}\) (maintainer) and the woman as *qanitah* (obedient) and *hafizatun lil-ghaib* (preserver of the secret). In Arabic, when a preposition is used after the verb i.e. when the preposition ‘*Ala’* is used after the verb *qaam*, the meanings of “protection” and “financial responsibility” are incorporated in the verb. This, in other words, refers to heading a family and all these things are mutually essential. The word *qawwam* has different interpretations which may or may not be influenced by different cultural attitudes prevalent during different times.\(^ {30}\) There is a difference between suggested meaning and received meaning in the Prophet’s words.\(^ {31}\) Word *qawwam* is interpreted in various meanings which are discussed here.

Allama Jasas (died 370 Hijrah) translates the word as men are responsible for protection, supervision, provision of their (women’s) necessities and maintaining them in other worldly affairs\(^{32}\). Tantawi (1928-2010) translates the verse to mean, “Men are like a *wali* and the women are like *raiyat* means the one for which *wali* is accountable. He said, superiority of man (*wali*) is for (1) maintaining women (2) *mahr* and (3) Allah SWT has granted man one superlative degree over woman.\(^ {33}\) Furthermore, Abdullah Yousuf Ali (1872-1953), explains the *wali* as the “protectors and maintainers of women”. It means one who stands firm in her business and in daily affairs or it may be, when he stands for her business, managing affairs with a steady purpose.”\(^ {34}\) Female scholars have translated it as “overseers and maintainers”.\(^ {35}\) Interviews conducted for this study\(^ {36}\) from rural women revealed that men -father, brother and husband- are responsible for their family’s protection, supervision and provisions of all necessities in daily routine. As a mother and grandmother, her son is responsible, as a daughter, her father is responsible to fulfill all worldly
necessities and as a wife, she has a right of maintenance from her husband during marriage contract and even after marriage contract during waiting period (iddah). In all worldly affairs, women are free from all liabilities, whereas men are duty bound to maintain them in worldly affairs.

According to Abul A’la Maududi (1903-1973), the word *qawwam* means “managers of women affairs”\(^{37}\), with the explanation that the Arabic word *qawwam* stands for a person who is responsible for the right conduct, safeguard and maintenance of the affairs of an individual, an institution or an organization. Thus man is governor, director, protector and manager of the affairs of women.\(^{38}\) Man has been given this authority because, Allah SWT has made the one superior to the other and men spend their wealth on women. Man has been made *qawwam* (governor) of the family because of his natural qualities and woman is dependent for her own safety and protection.\(^{39}\) Furthermore, many recent writers agree with Abul A’la Maududi that “Men are the managers of the affairs of women”.\(^{40}\)

During interviews, many women complained that man sometimes misuses this authority and thinks that a woman is bound to follow him in his all actions and she cannot decide her household matters as she is dependent for her worldly necessities. Whereas, in rural areas, women strongly believed that Allah SWT has given superior authority to men and women are bound to follow their husbands in any case. Due to this believe, many women are tortured by their husband in the state of drinking or alcohol and they never complaint as they think husband has right over them. This strong believe prevailed in their mind due to the teachings of the less educated *ulemas* and by observing existing practices of their antecedents.

Abdul Majid Daryabadi (1892-1977) explains the term *qawwam* as “overseers over women”\(^{41}\). He further added that “a *qawwam* is, in the vernacular of modern sociology, a protector or guardian of the family, and this is a position to which the man is by his very nature and constitution entitled”.\(^{42}\) Al Qurtabi (1214-1273) explains that *qawwam* is the superlative degree of *qiyyam*, thus men are responsible for supervision and provision in all matters and issues of women.\(^{43}\) He discussed in his book that men are at higher degree than women because they are the maintainer and supervisor of women. Muhammad Abduh similarly translates the verse 4:34 to mean:

[T]he husband’s *qiyyama* over his wife consists not in acts of tyranny but of guidance towards righteous behavior, education, domestic efficiency, houseboundness, and fiscal responsibility to his budgetary guidelines. Then the woman can keep her house in safety, and order and bear and raise the children. God has not “preferred” men over women. In individual cases, wives can even surpass their husbands in knowledge, work, bodily strength, and earning power. But it is by their biological and social functions in
Diversity of Interpretations Regarding Qawwam in Islamic Thought with Special Reference to Surah An-Nisa

the family that the sexes as a whole are addressed and organized in Surah 4:34.44

Engineer (born in 1939, India) expounds on this interpretation of the verse:
When the Quran gives man a slight edge over woman it clarifies that it is not due to any inherent weakness of the female sex, but to the social context...it is due to the social functions that were then performed by the two sexes. Since man earns and spends his wealth on women, he by virtue of this fact, acquires functional superiority over women.45

A question may be raised about the nature of this relative hierarchy, if husband is not discharging his responsibilities as maintainer and supervisor whether this relative hierarchy can be transferred to wife in household? One of Ghamidi’s (born in 1951) disciples has responded to this issue in the light of his views, that this scheme of relative hierarchy is ideal as per teachings of Quran and more particularly in reference to 2:2846 and when the Quran has placed this responsibility on husband, wife cannot be burdened by it on the one hand. On the other hand, misuse or non-discharge of this responsibility by husband does not prevent wife from resorting to other legal measures for enforcement of her rights which may include dissolution of marriage.47

According to Imam Malik and Shafii, if the man is not fulfilling his responsibility of being maintainer of his wife then he is not qawwam and his nikah would become fasiq48. On the other hand, Abu Hanifa states that nikah would not become fasiq and man would be given a chance until he becomes the maintainer.49

Many urban women in Pakistani society are working in different fields and earning more than their husbands. They are having an edge due to their financial contributions or other abilities. But when the Quran has connected qawwam with man, it is not easy for Muslim interpretive to explicitly transfer it to woman.

Jawad, in his book “The Rights of Women in Islam”, acknowledges that husband is the head of the family on the basis of reading of 4:34 and 2:228. He further explained that this headship does not in any way confer “license of dictatorship or misuse”.50 In contemporary Pakistani society, men are considered as head of family who have all authority to take decisions of family matters. In rural areas, somehow this authority is misused by men and they consider themselves as dictator of the house.

Syed Qutub (1906-1966) interpreted it to mean, “Men shall take full care of women”.51 He emphasizes that this verse deals with the institution of family, its management, delegation of responsibilities and defining duties. It gives instructions for the strength, stability and protection from internal conflicts.52 Mufti Usman Muhammad Shafi also translated it as “Men stand as caretaker of women”53. Furthermore, he argued that the rights of men and women are similar to each other but only with one exception that men have certain precedence in functional authority. It is also explained in another verse of Quran, this mantle of
authority placed on the shoulders of men is not that of a dictator and a tyrant. It commands men to treat women well as recognized by Shariah.  

Some scholars approach Surah 4:34 and interpret qawwamun from an economic stance. For example, Abdullah Yusuf Ali translates qawwamun as “one who stands firm in another’s business, protect his interests, and looks after his affairs; or it may be, standing firm in his own business, managing affairs, with steady purpose.”  

Riffat Hassan (born in 1943, Pakistan) argues: This [Qawwamun] is a plural form of a word which is generally translated as lord, master, ruler, governor, and manager. Once you make the man the ruler obviously you make the woman the ruled. You have established a hierarchical relationship. In fact this word doesn’t mean ruler at all. . . . [I]t means “breadwinner” and it is an economic term. [I]f we translate that word as breadwinner the interpretation of the entire verse changes. It’s talking about the division of functions that, while women have the primary responsibility of being childbearers, during that time when they are undergoing the process of childbearing they should not have the obligation of being breadwinners, and therefore men should be breadwinners during this period. This verse is addressed to the Islamic community in general, not to the husbands.

Ismail Ragi al-Faruqi (1921-1986, Palestinian) states that in twentieth century socioeconomic conditions, “women are no longer dependent on their husbands” and that the husband’s economic superiority is “subject to change.” Al-Hibri stresses two points: [N]owhere in the passage is there a reference to the male’s physical or intellectual superiority. Secondly, since men are “qawwamun” over women in matters where God gave some of the men more than some of the women, and in what the men spend of their money, then clearly men as a class are not “qawwamun” over women as a class.

In Pakistani society, where Hindu culture has over ruled Islamic way of life, the word qawwam is interpreted in a very patriarchal way, in the sense of ‘hakim’. All religious personalities, called as mullas, interpret this word in the same meaning. According to Maulana Mufti M. Shafi ‘men stand caretakers of women’. Qawwam in Arabic denotes a person who holds the responsibility or has the duty and charge to manage a job or run a system or take care of what has to be done about something, controlling all related factors therein. In Pakistan, the most common being in the sense of ‘hakim’ or one who rules, governs, or decides. Other alternates used are guardians, custodians, overseers and protectors. When taken in the sense of a care, a functional head, and not in the political sense of a ruler or dictator, the ‘qawwam’ or hakim of the Quran offers a base of understanding from common experience. It is obvious that, for any group-living, big or small, or for any organized system, it is rationally and customarily necessary that the group or system should
Diversity of Interpretations Regarding Qawwam in Islamic Thought with Special Reference to Surah An-Nisa

have some head, chief or authority so that he can pass judgment in the event of a difference and take decisions to run affairs smoothly. Such authoritative system of countries and states is universally acceptable and practiced. The need of authoritative system was felt in old times where tribal social organizations had the chief as authority of tribe. The misinterpretation and misuse of the word has resulted in increasing the number of the cases of violence against women in our society.

In Islamic perspective, men have no power or authority over women except in the context of marital relationship. But Muslims in their contemporary life have neglected many aspects of equality in religion and in other spheres of life. Due to lack of clear understanding, they think that they have supreme power over them and women are bound to follow them in any case. Contrary to this, on the basis of the uniform principles of Islamic jurisprudence, a Muslim woman enjoys the same capacity and freedom as enjoyed by a man.

V- Reasons for the Superiority of Man over Woman

Religious scholars have given different reasons for the patriarchal interpretation of Quran. Many scholars quote the following Hadith to show the superiority of men over women and that the wives have been commanded to obey their husbands in respectful things.

Qais B. Sa’d said: I went to al Hirah and saw people prostrating themselves before a satrap of theirs, so I said: the apostle of Allah SWT has most right to have prostration made before him. When I came to the Prophet (PBUH), I said: I went to al Hirah and saw them prostrating themselves before a strap of theirs, but you have most right, Apostle of Allah SWT, to have them prostrating before you. He said: tell me, if you were to pass my grave, would you prostrate yourself before it? I said: No. He then said: Do not do so. If I were to command anyone to make prostration before another I would command women to prostrate themselves before their husband, because of the special rights over them given to husbands by Allah SWT.

This Hadith highlights two main causes behind the superiority of men over women. The first reason mentioned in the words that Allah SWT has made one of them to excel the others (in some qualities) under His exclusive wisdom and consideration. It is a special privilege that Allah SWT has granted to his creature, as women are also being granted some privileges in other respects as mentioned in first part of this paper. It is simply based on the wisdom of creation, an exclusive privilege of the Creator. Man’s physical strengths and control over emotions make him more able and better equipped to take charge of the family. From the history of mankind, it is clear that the role of man is to provide food, wage war against enemies and to maintain peace and order in society. The woman, on the other hand, primarily stayed at home to provide a stable environment to the children.
The second reason as mentioned by the Holy Prophet (PBUH) is that it is man’s duty to financially support his family and to give a dower to his wife at the time of marriage. Tantawi, in his book Jawahar al Quran, elaborates that men are given this privilege because they spend their money on their wives. He considers man a qawwam that means wali and woman as raiyya that means subordinate, for whom men are granted privilege. In Pakistani society, many less educated religious scholars misunderstood Tantawi’s interpretation of the word qawwam and teach in their mosque to husbands that they have all rights over their wives. Due to teachings of Imam, a husband thinks that Allah SWT has made woman subordinate to him and he has privileges over his wife. Furthermore, they think that they can treat women in a manner whatever they want. Such understanding is prevalent in rural areas of Pakistan.

Otherwise, On the basis of the principles of Islamic jurisprudence, a Muslim woman enjoys the same capacity and freedom as enjoyed by a man. The Shari’ah also provides an equitable and fair role of woman in the economic life of the Muslim society. Just as much as they, husband and wife, share in the management of family affairs, she can contribute to the support of the family financially, although she is not legally bound to provide maintenance. This privilege is given to men under the injunctions of Quran. Ibn-ul-Arabi (1076-1148) describes that the priority in one degree above of men is basically due to his responsibility as qawwam and it has two dimensions as given by Quran: (i) perfection in intellect and manner and perfection in religion, Jihad, Amar Bil Maroof and Nahi Anil Munkar; and (ii) due to his catering for all her expenses of mahr, and maintenance.

According to Imam Al Qurtabi, as a result of marriage contract, man is called qawwam that means protector, maintainer and supervisor of women affairs, and if he is not maintaining her then marriage contract will be fasiq. But if we look at another important principle of life, it states that woman in term of her creation and nature, should not be subjected to go out, work and earn her own livelihood. Before marriage, her father is responsible for her maintenance, whereas, after marriage the responsibility devolves to her husband. One purpose of this differentiation is to keep her safe from roughing out like men. Many religious scholars argued that man is superior to woman because she has been created from his rib. Allah SWT has put her total responsibility over man. Another Hadith refers to the same point, as it is stated:

Abu Hurayrah reported Allah SWT’s messenger (PBUH) as saying: woman is like a rib, when you attempt to straight it, you would break it. And if you leave her alone you would benefit from her, and crookedness will remain in her.

“Creating from rib” is a metaphorical expression that signifies the temperament of women due to their physique, psychological patterns of their minds and the nature of the work assigned to them. Women are
physically weaker than men; they cannot defend and protect themselves with their physical strength. Man and woman both possess different tasks. Islam, in the light of this fact, has ordered the men to treat women kindly and tolerate the incompatibility of temperaments. He should provide her a chance of maximum utilization of her physical and mental potentials in all spheres of life.

VI- Approach of Muslim States towards Qawwam

One may find number of families in Muslim societies where wife is having an edge due to her financial contributions or other abilities. This creates particular tension among feminists, human rights representatives, interpreters of contemporary era, and among the legislatures of different Muslim states where husband is codified as head of family and wife is bound to obey her husband. They considered legislation of Muslim states as threat to the safety of woman, children and to the family institution as it codified supreme power of husband in family sphere. Contrary to this, true Islamic teachings protect woman from worldly troubles and command men to protect her and maintain her for all worldly necessities. It is therefore, necessary to mention here the legislation of few Muslim states concerning the issue.

In many Muslim states, husbands and wives have equal rights and it is incorporated in their state legislation. In Indonesia, both spouses are enjoying equal rights and responsibilities as mentioned in article, 31 of the Marriage Act, “the husband and wife shall bear the superior responsibility of maintaining a household. The husband is head of the family, and the wife is the mother of the household”. Under Moroccan law both spouses have mutual rights and responsibilities. Furthermore, Turkish Civil Code removes husband’s position as ‘Head of Household’. They consider both spouses on equal footing with equal powers of decision making in households affairs.

Whereas, in few Muslim states, husband is not mentioned as head of household in legislation; in Pakistan, section 9 of Muslim Family Law Ordinance (hereinafter MFLO) deals with the inherent rights and responsibilities of husband to maintain his wife. Under MFLO, maintenance is the husband's duty, within the limits of his ability and he is bound to maintain her during marriage contract and even after marriage during her waiting period (Iddah). Contrary to this legislation, generally in Pakistan and especially in rural areas of Pakistan, husband considered himself as the head of the family who has all powers to control woman. He, sometimes, thinks he has authority to rule over his family.

Moreover, there are some other Muslim states where the husband is head of household or has other powers of control over the wife. These states include Philippines, Senegal and Cameroon. Under the law of Iran, the husband is the head and manager of the household; whereas in the law of Sudan, the wife is bound to serve and obey the husband (except in committing a sin) and to maintain her husband and herself with her husband’s money. Obedience to the husband is an obligation on the wife that starts at the time the husband pays Maher and provides the matrimonial home. Breach in obedience gives the husband the right to withdraw maintenance.
These Muslim states, codified family law rendering husband as head of family to protect woman rights and to bound husband to maintain her wife by giving him superior status. However, this notion is misused by many husbands in contemporary Muslim world.

VII- Conclusion

Everyone moves within the circle of rights and obligations. Men are responsible for the protection and care of the family and women are responsible for taking care of home and children. As it is mentioned in the saying of Prophet (PBUH): “All of you are guardians and responsible for your wards. The ruler is a guardian and the man is a guardian of his family; the lady is a guardian and is responsible for her husband’s house and his offspring; so all of you are guardians and responsible for your wards.”

This Hadith holds the word “man is responsible for protection and care of his family”, which illustrates that man is neither hakim nor ruler but guardian of the family. This is only a separation of powers in one’s ownsphere for the better management of the house. It is further concluded that proper contextual interpretation of the Quran can meet the needs of contemporary human rights regime.

Moreover, Al-Hibri states that the traditional or out of context interpretation conflicts with the Quran because [I]n the Qur’an we have the following passage: “The believers, men and women, are ‘awliya,’ one of another.” “awlya” means “protectors,” “in charge,” “guides.” It is quite similar to “qawwamun.” How could women be “awliya” of men if men are superior to women in both physical and intellectual strength? As the Quran is free from contradictions “Do they not consider the Qur’an (with care)? Had it been from other than Allah, they would surely have found therein much discrepancy.” The contradiction must be in the conservative translation and application of the verse, which can be resolved by approaching the verse from the Quranic contextual interpretation.
Bibliography

Translations & Commentaries of Qur’an


Hadith Books


Books


**Articles**


4. On the position of women in Islam and Islamic society, Online available at
Diversity of Interpretations Regarding *Qawwam* in Islamic Thought with Special Reference to Surah An-Nisa


**Muslim Legislations**

1. Dissolution of Muslim Marriage Act 1939, Pakistan
2. Muslim Family Laws Ordinance, 1961, Pakistan
3. Muslim Personal law Act 1991, Sudan
4. Turkish Civil Code 2002
5. Indonesian Marriage Act, 1974
6. The Moroccan Family Code (Moudawana), 2004
7. Islamic Family Law, Malaysia
8. The Civil Code of Islamic Republic of Iran

---

1 “And among His Signs is this, that He created for you mates from among yourselves, that ye may dwell in tranquility with them, and He has put love and mercy between your (hearts): verily in that are Signs for those who reflect.” See Abdullah Yusuf ‘Ali, *The Meaning of the Holy Qur’an*, at Surah 30, verse 21 (Abdullah Yusuf ‘Ali trans., 5th ed. 1993).
2 “We did send apostles before thee, and appointed for them wives and children: and it was never the part of an apostle to bring a sign except as Allah permitted (or commanded). For each period is a Book (revealed)”. *Ibid*, at Surah 13, verse 38.
4 By pronouncing it *Misaq-E-Ghalizah* in Qur’anic verse 4: 21, “And how could ye take it when ye have gone in unto each other, and they have Taken from you a solemn covenant?”, See Abdullah Yusuf ‘Ali trans, *The Meaning of the Holy Qur’an*.
5 “They are your garments and ye are their garments”, *Ibid*. 2:187.
6 It is a marriage contract under Islamic Law.

15
Like Executive, Judiciary and legislature have different powers. They are neither superior nor inferior from each other. But it is for the better management of the state. The same rule is applicable for demarcation of duties of men and women in the family institution.

13 Ibid, at Surah 46, verse 19.
19 Shahid Aziz, Relationship between husband and wife,4.
20 Imam Fakhr ud-Deen ar-Razi is an author of “Mafateeh ul Ghayb” also known as “Tafsir Kabir” - A voluminous work covering many aspects including science and medicine. Ibn Taymiyyah once critically said of this tafsir that it “contains everything but tafsir”.
21 Qazi Abu Bakr ibn al-Arabi is author of “Akam al-Qur’an”- Known as ‘Qazi ibn al-Arabi’ (ibn Arabi the judge)to distinguish him from the famous Sufi ibn Arabi, he was a Maliki jurist from Andalusia (Muslim Spain) His tafsir was published in 3 volumes and contains commentary on the legal rulings of the Qur'an according to the Maliki school.
22 Imam Abu Abdullah al-Qurtabi: “al-Jami’ li Akam il-Qur'an” by the famous Maliki Jurist of Cordoba. This 10-volume tafsir is a commentary on the Qur'anic verses dealing with legal issues. Although the author was a Maliki he also presents legal opinions of other major schools of Islamic jurisprudence; thus it is popular with jurists from all of the schools of Islamic law. One volume of this tafsir was translated into English by Aisha Bewley.
23 al-Jasas book “Akam al-Qur’an”- Based on the legal rulings of the Hanafi school of Islamic law. This was published in 3 volumes and remains popular amongst the Hanafis of India, the Middle East and Turkey.
24 He was well known Indian Islamic scholar.
His book *Tafheem ul Quraan* - One of the most widely read Tafsir, is another relatively modern exegesis of the Quran. It is written mostly for the general public with a view to relate the Islamic teachings to all sphere's of life. It is criticized for its free style explanations.

A known Egyptian Islamic Scholar.


This choice is based on man’s best capacities rather than his superiorities. See Ghamidi, *The Social Shariah of Islam*, pp. 160-165.

Different Interpretation of this term in different times, Now days, *Mullas* has interpreted in their own term which is *hakim*.


Tahira Saffarzadeh, *The Holy Qur’an Translation with commentary*, (Tehran, Iran, Alhoda, 2007).

To know the actual misconception and malpractices existed in Pakistani society, interviews were conducted from rural and urban woman on above mentioned issues.


*Ibid*.


Maulana Abdul Majid Daryabadi,*Tafseer-e-majdi*,( Islamic Book Foundation, Islamabad).

He has given references from bible as to the subjective position of women to their husbands marking the difference in attitude and instructions for dealing with women by Islam. He also provides references from sociological literature for the family structures and systems in dealing with the issue. See Daryabadi, *Tafseer-e-majdi* 325, 326.

Qurtabi,Muhammad bin Ahmad Al Ansari, *Al Jamai’ Al Ahkam Al Qur’an*, (Darul- Fikar, 1952), 169.


46 “And their husbands have the better right to take them back in that period, if they wish for reconciliation. And women shall have rights similar to the rights against them, according to what is equitable; but men have a degree (of advantage) over them. And Allah is Exalted in Power, Wise”. See Abdullah Yusuf ‘Ali trans, *The Meaning of the Holy Qur’an, Surah 2*, verse 228.


57 Barbara Stowasser, *Gender Issues and Contemporary Quran Interpretation,* 39.


61 Dr Israr Ahmed, a famous religious person in Pakistani society also interprets word Qawaam as Hakim. For further reading listen her lectures on Surah An Nisa.


63 “God has got ready forgiveness and tremendous rewards for the Muslim men and women; the believing men and women; the devout men and women; the truthful men
Diversity of Interpretations Regarding Qawwam in Islamic Thought with Special Reference to Surah An-Nisa

and women; the patiently suffering men and women; the humble men and women; the almsgiving men and women; the fasting men and women, the men and women who guard their chastity; and the men and women who are exceedingly mindful of God”. (Al Ahzab, 35)


66 “Allah SWT has made the one of them to excel the other”.

67 Shafi, Ma’ariful Qur’an, 419.

68 A woman has given great tasks of childbearing, breast feeding and looking after her children. These all tasks need same physical, psychological and mental powers.

69 It is general rule of precedence that man’s head over his hand, his heart over his stomach. In this case, precedence of man’s head over his hand does not diminish the role and importance of the hand, similarly, precedence of man does not lowering of the status of women, because both of them are parts of each other’s body, if man is the head, women is the body. See Shafi, Ma’ariful Qur’an, 419


71 “They spend from their means”.

72 According to Tantawi the reasons are known for mehar and nafaqa


74 “Women have similar rights over men as men have over women” (2 : 228).


77 Muhammad bin Ahmad Al Ansari Qurtabi, Al Jamai Ahkam Al-Qur’an, (Dar-ul Fikar, 1952), 170.

78 It is hardly conducive to her running around offices and markets, doing jobs and laborious work to earn a live hood.

79 But this view is contradictory. It is a biblical explanation, not a Qur’anic one. Woman is not created from the rib of man as mentioned in the verses of Qur’an 4:1 and 16:72. For detail see, Shehzad Saleem, Islam and Women: Misconceptions and Misperceptions, (2005).

80 Shafi, Ma’ariful Qur’an, 420.
Some scholars consider man and woman as active and passive members. Which are interrelated with each other and cannot be separated.

Under art.31(3), “the husband shall protect the wife and provide her with all the necessities of life in accordance with his capabilities, while under A. 34 the wife shall take care of the household to the best of her ability”.


In Morocco, people are followers of Malki School of thought.

Under art. 51 of the Moudawana, “spouses have mutual duties and rights, including: cohabitation, mutual fidelity, respect and affection, the preservation of the interests of the family; mutual inheritance; the wife’s assuming with the husband responsibility for managing household affairs and the children’s education; consultation on decisions concerning the management of family affairs, children and family planning; good relations with each other’s relatives. This gender-neutral list drastically amended the pre-2004 provisions”.

The followers of Hanfi School of thought.

The new amendment was added under article 41 and 186.

The New Legal Status of Women in Turkey, **Women for Women’s Human Rights** (Istanbul, New Ways, 2002).

The followers of Hanfi School of thought.

Many inherent rights can be understood from Dissolution of Muslim Marriage Act.


Ibid.

Bukhari, **Sahih**, Kitab al jumah,Bab al Jumah fi Al-Qur’an, Hadith No.893.

Like Executive, Judiciary and legislature has different powers. They are neither superior nor inferior from each other. But it is for the better management of state. The same rule is applicable for demarcation of duties of men and women.

Abdullah Yusuf ‘Ali trans, **The Meaning of the Holy Qur’an**. Surah 9, verse 71

Azizah Al-Hibri, **A Study of Islamic Herstory: or How did We Ever Get into this Mess? in Women and Islam** 212 (Azizah Al-Hibri ed., 1982), 218.

A Comprehension of Zarrūq’s Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf

*Ghulam Shams-ur-Rehman

**Abstract**
Ahmad Zarrūq (d. 899/1493) was the most influential Sufi scholar working in North Africa in the fifteenth century. He introduced the concept of juridical Sufism in his attempt to reconcile theology and jurisprudence with Sufism (thus merging sharī‘ah with ūrūqāh). His magnum opus, the Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf, is highly regarded for its distinctive method and construction. In this study I shall present a comprehension of the contents of the Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf according to the best-preserved manuscript of the work, which is held by the Escorial in Madrid ((MS no. arabe 741). The manuscript contains a preface, 224 principles and an epilogue. This study should enable future scholars to approach Ahmad Zarrūq’s writing with a firm understanding of its structure and contents.

**Introduction:**
Ahmad Zarrūq was an interesting figure in the field of Sufism in the Maghreb. He was a jurist, theologian and prolific writer of Islamic studies. Al-Kūhīn records: “It was calculated that from the time of his birth till his death that he wrote half a page a day.” His writings are on various topics in different fields of Islamic sciences but his major work is concerned with the commentaries on the books of Mālikī jurisprudence and Shādhili Sufism, focusing on his goal to unify and diffuse Islamic legal rectitude alongside Sufi devotion. He interpreted the Shādhili’s thoughts and presented a distinctive concept of juridical Sufism. His Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf is the most important work to accomplish his reform programme of amalgamation of Sacred law and Sufi path. Being a jurist and theologian, Zarrūq selects the qawā‘id genre to present Sufi concepts, producing a harmony and balance between Sufi piety, Islamic law and theology. He intentionally tries to win over the jurists and those rationally minded in favour of Sufism by using the principles of jurisprudence, theology and logical reasoning to legitimise Sufi thought and practice.

According to the MS of Escorial, Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf consists of a preface, an epilogue and two hundred and twenty four principles. There is no evidence which endorses the idea that Zarrūq counted the number of principles. However, in all earlier MSS, principles were not counted but separated one principle from the other marking the word qā‘idah. These principles are divided into seventeen chapters which consist of unequal loosely related qawā‘id. Each chapter is marked by bāb. Nonetheless there are some variations in the arrangement of principles and chapters but its main skeleton is almost similar in all MSS except in the MS of Berlin. It is very difficult to decide who arranged these principles in this particular form.

*Assistant Professor, Department of Islamic Studies, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan.*
‘Alî al-Muttaqi recorded that the book had “very useful and important principles” but most of them were scattered without proper chapterization. Al-Muttaqi arranged these qawā‘id into eight chapters with appropriate titles. On the other hand, Zarrūq indicates in the introduction that he has divided this abridged book into chapters. After a doxology, he explains the purpose of this book: “The purpose of this abridged (mukhtasār) version and its chapters is to introduce the principles and foundations of Sufism in a way that integrates sharī‘ah with haqīqah and incorporates the theology and jurisprudence with tariqah.” This short introduction not only describes the nature of the work but also indicates that Zarrūq himself compiled this book in a particular form as well. It cannot be claimed for certain that the present arrangement of the book is the same as what the author had or intended. However a comprehension of Qawā‘id is presented according to the arrangement of Escorial MS in this article.

**A Comprehension of Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf**

**Preface:**
Doxology: Zarrūq praises God ‘as He deserves for His Highness and Majesty and blessing and prayers for our master Muḥammad and his family/folk’. Zarrūq explains the purpose of the book and seeks the assistance from God to fulfil his aims.

**Chapter One:** This contains twelve principles and describes the introduction of the subject matter, its importance, scope and limitations.

Zarrūq writes that the understanding of a subject matter is necessary before going into any advanced argument and the debate about a thing is a dialectical procedure used to explain the essence of something and its benefit through employing acquired or innate intellect. The use of reason is necessary to evaluate the reality of something through refutation and acceptance by ascertaining its foundation and explaining its details. Zarrūq further elaborates that the fundamental nature or essence of something is its reality and its reality is perceived through its total nature and explained in a comprehensive definition, elucidated illustration or clear interpretation. There are almost two thousand definitions of Sufism and all of them are referred back to sincere intention towards God the Most-High. In reality, these definitions are different features of the same thing. The reason for these different interpretations of a reality is due to the incomprehensibility of its total nature. Therefore, everyone explains it according to his own knowledge, spiritual state and intuition. Because of this, a difference of opinion in Sufism is observed. Zarrūq opines that whosoever has a sincere intention towards God, has a share of Sufism and Sufism of everyman is the sincerity of his intention towards God.

Sincerity of intention is conditioned by seeking the good pleasure of God or doing that which gratifies Him. Zarrūq deduces by the verse (Q39/al-Zumar. 7) that seeking the pleasure of God is conditioned by belief in Him. Action is necessary for the realization of a true faith. Therefore there is no Sufism without jurisprudence.
because the esoteric rules of God can be recognized only through the exoteric prescriptions (jurisprudence). There is also no jurisprudence without Sufism, because action is unacceptable and invalid without the purification of intention. Both jurisprudence and Sufism are invalid without true faith. Therefore, the unification of all three disciplines is necessary because they are linked with each other in a principle as souls are linked with bodies.

Zarrūq states that referring something to its origin and endorsing it with an appropriate argument invalidates the argument of the one seeking to oppose it. The origin of Sufism is the station of iḥsān which has been described in the Prophetic tradition: “you should worship God as though you see Him, and if you do not see Him, He nonetheless sees you.” Therefore affirmation of Sufism is indeed affirmation of its origin. Jurisprudence explicates Islam, theology elucidates imān and Sufism illuminates iḥsān. Thus Sufism is one of the basic components of religion.

Zarrūq defines tasawwuf and writes that the terminology of something assists in understanding the reality of it and elaborates its definition and subject matter in a comprehensive way. Taṣawwuf is an Arabic word, perfectly derived, non-ambiguous, and very clear and its etymology denotes the meaning concisely. Etymology demands consideration of the meaning of a derived noun and its roots. The connotation of a derived word is perceived from the word itself. If there are many connotations of a word then its perception is also divergent. Then one should try to synthesize them if possible otherwise all connotations are to be considered if there is no contradiction with the linguistic root. Many derivations of taṣawwuf are made by the experts. Zarrūq reveals five of them; however, he prefers the last of these, according to which, Sufism is derived from suffah (the bench) and Sufis have the same qualities of the people of suffah who are praised by God in the Qurʾān. Zarrūq clarifies that the people of suffah were poor and they were known as the guests of God. Later on some of them became very rich. They praised God when they were blessed, just as they had remained patient in the past when they were poor. All the time they sought the pleasure of God. Therefore Sufism is not related to poverty or wealth. The fundamental condition is seeking the pleasure of God.

Zarrūq ascertains that the difference of judgment is sometimes due to the contradiction of realities or sometimes due to the different levels in a single reality; Sufism, poverty (faqr) and self-blame (malāmāh) are all related to the latter. The Sufi always endeavours to purify himself from all things other than God and when he has nothing in his hands except God then he becomes a faqīr whilst a malāmīt is one who lives under blameworthy conditions: he neither appears good nor hides his bad actions. One who has close proximity with God (muqarrab) is perfect in spiritual stations. He lives with his Lord for his Lord. He has nothing to state except the Truth and he has no calm and abode without God while the different ways do not necessarily lead to the different aims. Some times the single plan is achieved with
The required ability for Sufism is that a man has sincere intention, or he is a gnostic who has realized reality or a truthful devotee, or an honest seeker, or a scholar who is fastened with the esoteric realities or an expert of jurisprudence who is tied to the profound sense of the sacred texts. But a man is incapable and unprepared for Sufism if he is ignorant or a false claimant of knowledge or a habitual user of harsh language in arguments or an unintelligent layman, or unenthusiastic seeker or a man who has firm determination to blindly imitate great men. Zarrūq considers Sufism as the most dignified discipline and argues that if the dignity of something is due to its fundamental nature then that thing should be sought due to its fundamental nature. If the dignity of something is due to its advantage then it should be sought as a means to reach the reality. If the dignity of something is due to something attached to it, then advantage is to be sought in its associated subject. The knowledge of God Most-High is the most superior knowledge because it is the most magnificent and prominent. The dignity of this knowledge is due to its fundamental nature.\(^8\)

**Chapter Two:** This chapter consists of nineteen principles and it deals with the multidisciplinary and overlapping topics of Sufism, jurisprudence and theology, superiority of Sufism over other disciplines and methods of teaching it.

Zarrūq states that Sufism is a science of purification and restoration of heart while Jurisprudence is for the rectification of actions and implementation of order and system. Theology is to examine the beliefs with evidence and proof and adorning the faith with conviction. The dignity of something is due to the dignity of its contents and Sufism is the noblest discipline because of its contents. It deals with the fear of God in the beginning and leads to the gnosis of Him in the end. However there is difference of opinion regarding Sufi teachings. Al-Thawrī did not allow teaching the Sufi tradition to every one whilst al-Junayd preached this tradition to everyone.\(^9\)

After describing al-Junayd’s notion, Zarrūq argues that the difference of opinion is due to difference of correlation and forms. Therefore a careful and cautious conduct is necessary. Sahl alludes that after two hundred years, if someone has [some] of our knowledge, he should bury it because asceticism shall be only in the speeches of the people and their lord would be their stomachs.\(^10\) Zarrūq states that this is the case in his own time. People have utilized the knowledge of subtle realities and truths for worldly purposes and engaged themselves in reprehensible innovations and prohibited things and laymen believe their heredity claim for Sufism.

Zarrūq states that there are some specific or general matters in every discipline and Sufism is no different. The rules of God related to the human conduct are for everyone and other rules should be delivered according to the ability of the listener. He believes that acquiring advanced knowledge and perfection is the habit of true devotees but it is necessary that one should seek the basic discourse of the discipline
A Comprehension of Zarrūq’s *Qawā'id al-Taṣawwuf* (i. e. Sufism) before indulging oneself in the subtle esoteric realities. Sufism is a science for particular people not for the masses. All rules should be given in their proper place. Actions are for the common people, spiritual states are for the initiates, gains and advantages are for followers and subtle realities are for the Gnostics. Zarrūq argues that participation in an original principle demands the participation in its practical application. Jurisprudence and Sufism both are partners showing the ways towards the rulings of God and His rights. Thus both are under the same principle in excellence and deficiency, and knowledge is necessary for both. The Prophet sought refuge in God from knowledge which had no benefit.

Zarrūq states that acting upon the rules of God is necessary and Sufism without practice is deception while any action is inappropriate without the perception of its wisdom and rationale. Therefore the correct way is first of all to seek knowledge, then action, then dissemination and then perfection. It is most appropriate to investigate a thing from its sources. It is a fact that the knowledge of subtle realities of esoteric sciences is a special divine act of kindness and it cannot be obtained from ordinary practice. Therefore, the consideration of three points is necessary: i) act upon the knowledge as much as possible ii) seek refuge in God for enlightenment iii) follow the *sunnah* in all of one’s actions.

Zarrūq opines that all prophets and saints have been afflicted. Accordingly, every disciple has to face affliction and suffering in the way (Sufism). A disciple should be content in conditions of both prosperity and adversity. Knowledge is sought from the Legislator or one who is appointed by Him. Piety is only valuable when it is compatible with a principle that increases the intellect and develops the faculties. As far as Jurisprudence is concerned, its rules are general in nature and scope because it aims towards the implementation of the form of religion. On the other hand, the authority of Sufism is particular and it is the relation between a person and his Lord and nothing else. Therefore a jurist can deny Sufism but not *vice versa*. Hence it has been said: “Be a jurisprudent Sufi not a Sufi jurisprudent.” The Sufi of the jurists is more perfect than the jurist of the Sufis because the Sufi of jurists has grasped Sufism not only by spiritual states, but by actions and insights as well.

Zarrūq argues that one should observe the relationship between a “principle rule” (*asl*) and its practical application (*far*’) for correct deduction and conclusion. If the difference of judgments in a principle positively or negatively is based on an invalid relationship, then its conclusion is void and misleading. Everyone should understand the difference between contradiction and difference of opinion. Zarrūq further argues that every seeker has to follow a method of learning. Its process is at the beginning, listening and admitting, followed by envisioning and understanding, then rationalization and analysis, then practice and dissemination. Discussion with the men of knowledge is essential for the seeker, but this must be done with honesty and modesty.
The methods of learning help to achieve the aim. A suitable question is half of knowledge. Zarrūq explains the difference between contradiction and difference of opinion. He cites the saying of Ibn ʿArif that every true seeker of knowledge must observe three things: i) seeking knowledge without prejudice ii) understanding the subject and strip it from all kinds of ambiguities iii) comprehending the difference between contradiction and difference of opinion. He asserts that the purpose of jurisprudence is to establish a general rule that eliminates and eradicates hardships. The purpose of Sufism is to search for perfection that can be achieved only by the actualization of the best in law and wisdom. Theology is for the affirmation of prohibitions and commandments. 12

Chapter Three: This chapter consists of ten principles. Sufi methodology and its interpretation and links with other disciplines and some theological issues.

Zarrūq explains that the subject matter of a discipline is derived from its primary principles; however some other discipline might participate in the same subject matter and differ with it in some aspects such as jurisprudence, Sufism, and theology. The jurist investigates a matter in order to prove an exoteric rule for an exoteric action; the Sufi examines an esoteric rule for the realization of esoteric reality; the theologian evaluates the rules of negation and affirmation. Their principal rules are the Book, sunnah and rational interpretations which are approved by the Book and sunnah. Zarrūq argues that a thing can be described by its example and proved by argumentation. A heretic is like a man who rebuffs free will (al-jabr) and negates wisdom and general rules. The sunni is like the People of the Cave that are mentioned in the Prophetic parable, when they were blocked by a boulder in the cave. Each one prayed for his best deeds to be taken into account. 13 The Sufi is like a man who borrowed one thousand dinars and made God his witness and guarantor. 14 If one is not expert in a discipline, one should be silent; otherwise one’s talk may give the wrong impression about the discipline. It is better for one to transmit the written message in order to save one’s expression from ambiguity and imprecision.

Zarrūq argues that a practical application is evaluated by its original principle. If there is compatibility between them, then it is accepted. If there is contradiction, and no possibility of means of reconciling them, then it is rejected. The Sufi fanatics are similar to those theologians who have heretical ideas. Their judgments and deeds are to be refuted - but the right path is not to be rejected or denied. Compilation of a science from its origin is a very significant task and it helps the seeker to understand the nature of the science and recognise its limitations. The deduction of a science from its practical application is possible but it is difficult due to the profundity of perception.

Zarrūq records that when the foundation and practical applications of a science are well established and recognized, then the seeker can easily understand it. In this context, the earlier generation has no superiority or pre-eminence over the later
generations rather the later scholar is more perfect because he has more knowledge from his predecessor. However, the transmission and opinion of the scholars is to be accepted but evaluation and assessment of their opinion is essential because they are not infallible. Knowledge is based on argument and esoteric states are based on submission and faith. Therefore if a gnostic speaks about a religious matter, it should be examined according to the Book and sunnah. If he speaks about an esoteric knowledge then it should be evaluated according to his spiritual state. A rational argument is self-evident, but for transmitted knowledge, it is significant to investigate the authority of the transmitter. One should be acquainted with this method to save himself from blind affirmation. Zarrūq gives brief definitions of blind affirmation (al-taqlīd), emulation (al-iqtīdā’), discernment (al-tabaṣṣur), independent judgment (al-ijtīhād) and a school of jurisprudence (al-madhhab) with the reference to Miftāḥ al-Saʿādah by Ibn al-ʿArīf.15

Chapter Four: This chapter consists of thirteen principles. It explains the diversity and uniformity of religious thoughts, authority of religious scholars, its limitations, Sufi behaviour in this regard and some theological issues.

Zarrūq formulates a rule that only one who is infallible, or a man whose pre-eminence is attested, is to be followed. The Prophetic tradition: “The best of the ages is mine” vindicates emulation. The companions of the Prophet had different kinds of traditions and the next generation collected all these traditions and their successors evaluated and examined them and then there were religious masters in all disciplines. The interpretation of the leading scholars is to be accepted in their disciplines and their emulation is valid in the region where they have acceptance. Zarrūq argues that a ruling for a particular case should not be generalised. It has been described in some traditions that a minority of the Muslim community will remain on the right path till the day of judgement. These kinds of traditions pertain to inform us coming future and are not contradicted by traditions which describe a general rule e.g that spiritual purification (al-tazkiyyah) is obligatory upon all Muslims. Similarly the subdivision of a principle rule produces the subdivision in its practical application. Therefore association with a fundamental principle is sufficient to protect oneself from confusion. The inspiration and light of a man is according to his guide. Those who get spiritual inspiration from the saying of scholars and divine book and sunnah, their inspiration are perfect but they were deprived from the light of emulation.

Zarrūq asserts that it is not permissible for a follower of a particular school of law to seek the validity of a prohibited matter from another school of law except out of necessity. However one can seek guidance from other schools if a matter is not prohibited or explained in his school of law. Similarly, every text generally has some ambiguities. Some of them are resolved at the first instance without any deep thinking while others are very complex and confuse the reader. This kind of vagueness is a dominant feature of the books of later Sufis. Authentication of a
principle-rule is necessary for the confirmation of its practical applications. It is sufficient to establish the foundation of religion and its applications according to the principles established by the leading scholars. Zarrūq explains the theological creed of belief and states that the Sufi doctrine is based on following the path of pious ancestors. However, the existence of al-mūhim, al-mubham, al-mushkil in the texts of the shari‘ah is to test the intellects, wisdom and beliefs of the people as revealed in the Qurān. Only the statement of the Originator of sacred law (shārī‘) is acceptable in ambiguous cases. He further maintains that a text which has many aspects and meanings is to be interpreted on the basis of probability and no one can claim that this is the exact will of God.

The rulings of the Divine Attributes (ṣifāt al-rabbāniyyah) are unchangeable and their effects are non-transferable. Zarrūq writes that God attached His order with His will which is unchangeable. Therefore it is not permissible for a Muslim to degrade and humiliate the people of the Prophetic household because God verified their purity and purified them from abomination in the Qurān, which contains expressions of God’s eternal rulings. The Prophetic tradition: “Salmān is from us, the People of the House” is due to Salmān having a perfect religious relationship with the Prophet. Zarrūq states the pre-eminence of ʿAbd al-Qādīr al-Jīlānī is perfect because he has both blood and religious ties with the Prophet. Zarrūq also reveals that the biographies are for introductions and there is no need to introduce a well-known personality.

Chapter Five: This chapter consists of eleven principles. It elaborates the pre-eminence and supremacy of Sufism over other disciplines, reasons for the diversity of Sufī orders and the need for a shaykh.

The Sufī’s perception, according to Zarrūq, is more profound than that of other experts of different disciplines. A jurist attempts to eradicate hardship and a Sufi aims to attain perfection. A theologian endeavours to correct the belief and a Sufi attempts to strengthen faith with conviction. The expert of exegesis and the traditionalist explains the rule and its meaning and Sufi goes beyond this, but only after acknowledging their interpretations. Zarrūq maintains that the subdivision of a practical application is due to the subdivision of its principle. Sufism is in fact the station of spiritual virtue (iḥsān) that is divided into two forms: the slave witnessing his Lord or the Lord watching His slave.

Zarrūq views that the difference in paths produces ease. There are different Sufī orders and their way of training, and all are on the right path through the establishment of the sacred law and the avoidance of reprehensible actions. Submission to the best is desirable and Sufism is based on the following the best. The good has multiple aspects and every aspect is desirable according to the mental disposition of people. Laymen should follow the easiest and clearest path. Zarrūq argues that knowledge must be sought from the experts of the respective disciplines.
A Comprehension of Zarrūq’s Qawā’id al-Taṣāwuf

Jurisprudence is to be learned from the jurists not from the Sufis; similarly, Sufism is to be learned from Sufis not from jurists, unless, of course, the jurist recognises Sufism as well. Understanding the proper meaning of a word is necessary for the seeker of knowledge and anyone who ignores the language cannot grasp its meaning properly. He will thereby bring about damaging and dangerous results. Zarrūq observes that general piety (taqwā) is followed as a means to attaining scrupulous piety (wara‘). Taqwā is leaving the unnecessary and that which does not concern one. A doubt without any indication is a diabolical suggestion, and scrupulous piety without sunnah is an innovation. He further explains that righteousness is the highest degree of piety which instils in one the ethics of the Qur’ān and sunnah. The process of righteousness is completed through a sincere shaykh.20

Chapter Six: This chapter consists of ten principles. It explains the need of the shaykh, purpose of different disciplines and their principles and importance in relation to the foundational rules in spiritual guidance.

Zarrūq opines that one should fasten oneself to a principle to avoid disintegration. Therefore, following (iqtidā) of a shaykh is indispensable. The shaykh’s obedience to the sunnah must be established, and authority in gnosis is to be recognized. He concludes that a shaykh is necessary in order to ascend, spiritually, to the level of one who can consult spiritual openings (futūḥāt) just as the Prophet consulted Waraqah when suddenly revelation began to come to him. Zarrūq argues that the jurist evaluates a legal opinion on the basis of its principle. A matter is acceptable if it does not contradict any principle such as recitation of surah yāsīn near the dead body. Similarly the traditionalist examines a legal opinion from the text of a tradition according to its status and transmission, namely whether that is a ṣaḥīḥ, hasan, ḍa‘īf or mawdū‘. The beatification of ethics comes through a continuous practice and Sufism deals with this subject particularly.

Zarrūq states that piety and its different expressions are revealed in al-Qūt of Abū Ṭalib al-Makkī and al-Iyyā‘ of Muḥammad al-Ghazālī. Al-Qūt illustrates different forms of virtues which do not contradict the sunnah. However, there are many inauthentic and weak traditions in both of the above mentioned works. Zarrūq reveals the method of research of philosophers and logicians and advises us to use their method in the verification of texts but, he adds, one should not absorb himself completely in their discourse. He further maintains that there are many ambiguities in understanding the cosmological realities. Therefore it has been said: stay away from al-Būnī and his likes and follow Khayr al-Nassāj and others like him.

Zarrūq argues that the aim of a theologian is to illuminate faith with conviction. The Shādhiliyyah use this methodology in their spiritual training because this is the quickest way to achieve the objective. According to Zarrūq, the multiplicity of a basic principle creates the multiplicity of its practical applications. Thus, every Sufi
order is based on many principles except the Shādhiliyyah, which is founded on a single principle. Their single principle is the abandonment of self-direction in the face of God’s decree. If there is a fundamental principle then its subdivision into principles and practical applications is useful in order to recognize the nature and limitation of the principle.  21

**Chapter Seven:** This chapter consists of ten principles. It describes the classification of knowledge and its application and also explains the cautious behaviour required in doubtful matters.

Zarrūq states that the knowledge of Sufism can be divided into three forms: i) knowledge of discourse and caution ii) knowledge of practices and servanthood iii) knowledge of revelation. The Qurān and sunnah are the main source of all sciences. Some people extract knowledge from the external words of the text; they are Zāhiriyah (literalist) while the others analyse them by different interpretation; they are jurists. Others go further to find out the essence of the external text and internal meaning after establishing the interpretations of jurists, and they are Sufis.

Zarrūq explains the classical division of sacred law into three forms: necessary (darūrī), needful (ḥāji) and complementary (taḥṣīnī). He asserts that excellence in religious states does not grant any one the right to do something above or beyond the law. The legal system is for everyone and there is no exception on the basis of piety or devoutness. Knowledge of God’s commandments is necessary for everyone before embarking upon practice. He argues that acquiring knowledge from its foundation is straightforward. The questions must be answered according to the ability of questioner. Ambiguous thoughts are not acceptable without clarification. Therefore one should not claim knowledge that he does not possess. Similarly, rejection of knowledge of something without proper knowledge of it is unfair and biased. Similarly, knowledge of something does not permit someone to remain silent when he observes something which is certainly wrong. Homosexuality and adultery are clearly prohibited but killing, taking of money may be sanctioned in certain circumstances. Although hesitation and caution is desirable in doubtful cases, which can be distinguished from the situation when something good or bad is manifest. Therefore the denunciation of a Muslim on the basis of doubt is not valid.  22

**Chapter Eight:** This chapter consists of ten principles. It describes the spirit of religion, recommends the moderate and balanced path in all matters and emphasizes on the restoration of order.

Zarrūq proclaims that excellence in worship comes by observing its requirements and implementing the bounds that God has placed on man’s freedom of action. A Sufi disciple should not follow the reprehensible innovations and seek concession in religious matters (rukhaṣ). Zarrūq states that the whisperings of the devil (waswasah)
are religious innovation that can be removed with the remembrance of God. The good is based on eating permissible food and keeping good company. All believers are ordered to seek permissible earnings that are possible for everyone in all times. God does not hold us liable for what is in His knowledge but He does hold us liable for that which we know and from whence we know it. The preservation of order and public good is indispensable. Therefore the community has agreed that it is prohibited to revolt against the imām. Similarly, the jihād under the leadership of a amīr is obligatory even though he may not be pious.

Zarrūq devises a principle that the worship of God demands to perform all obligatory duties according to the Sacred Law, whether these are commandments (ʿazīmah) or legal dispensations (rukhas). There is no preference of commandments over legal dispensations because both are the orders of God; however, a disciple should avoid interpretation and taking concessions which go against scrupulous piety. A disciple should aim to accord with to the Truth and it is good if someone’s inner desires are also compatible with the Truth. Zarrūq relates the saying of ʿUmar b. ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz: “If the Truth is according to one’s desire, this is just honey blended with butter.”

Zarrūq opines that reward is on the basis of submission to God and not upon the basis of hardships caused by this submission. Therefore faith, remembrance of God, and recitation are greater than any physical actions, even though the latter are more demanding. Excess is prohibited in acts of religious devotion and moderation is recommended in all actions. He further maintains that constituting a rule that is not in the sacred law is a kind of innovation in religion particularly if it is contradicted by the shariʿah. Similarly, removal of something from its place causes the introduction of its opposite in its place. Therefore a disciple is advised to recite many prayers at the beginning for the purification of his heart and when his heart becomes free from egocentric desires, he is advised to concentrate on a single invocation.23

Chapter Nine: This chapter consists of eleven principles. It describes the significance of invocations and illustrates the permissible and prohibited matters with their justification and rationale.

Zarrūq views that if someone has a natural inclination towards acquiring knowledge he learns very fast. It has been said that if a child is taught according to his inclinations he becomes an expert in a discipline. A novice should be allocated invocations and practices according to his natural disposition and God’s aid will be given in accordance with the intention of the servant. It is easy to acquire a thing through repetition. A novice should continuously perform particular invocations until he attains the intended result otherwise he is like a well digger who does not concentrate on digging in one place, but digs a little over a large area. Repetition is the means, and not the end of spiritual practice. Zarrūq further maintains that the durability (dawār) of something is based on the durability of its sources and any
reward is according to intention. Excessively seeking worldly benefits is dangerous because it leads to activities devoid of spirituality such as treasure-hunting, alchemy and the like.

Zarrūq argues that the preservation of a system is necessary, and therefore, all acts contrary to the system are condemned. For example knowing alchemy, numerology and astrology for a wage are harmful, since all of these elements are opposed the wisdom of the intellect. Whereas, upholding the outer form of wisdom is necessary. One must ascertain the wisdom of religion according to his own situation - without looking at the state of others. The Prophet approved the people of ṣuffāh being aloof from worldly matters, but at the same time he ordered Ḥakīm b. Ḥuzām to seek a means of living.24

Zarrūq says that if there is equal benefit in performing a thing or leaving it, then leaving it is better than performing it. For example in an uncertainty between silence and speech; it is better to be silent. However, there must be a reason for the preference in each case. The status of a thing that is praised or condemned for some reason other than its inner qualities, may be reversed through a cause that demands a different ruling such as leadership is praised for establishing order, and condemned because it leads to arrogance. Zarrūq maintains that a forbidden matter become permissible for the greater good such as lying to establish peace between people. The process of seeking good and leaving evil needs a continuous effort. Therefore it has been said that desisting from sins is easier than asking for repentance. God’s generosity is so great that no one’s sin is above His forgiveness. Similarly, His majesty is such that He may punish any sinner. Therefore everyone should be conscious of both of these attributes of God at all times.25

Chapter Ten: This chapter consists of nine principles. It explains the special characteristics of words and their effects, the significance of litanies and the importance of the spiritual retreat and purification of the heart.

Zarrūq writes that the existence of particular qualities in the words, deeds and characters are confirmed. Invocations have the attribute of saving their invoker from the punishment of God. Zarrūq says that he has seen the people who were invoking through blasphemous words/formulas. Whereas, the shari‘ah permits all invocations which have clear meanings. Whatever is advised for the sake of education must be restricted to those particular words without addition or subtraction. Therefore if there are certain numbers mentioned for an invocation then it should be limited to that number only. It is the responsibility of a man that he should not exaggerate in the obligatory commandments. Furthermore, he should understand the reason of the prohibition.
Zarrūq states that purification of the heart is demanded for worship. One should avoid all those people who are immature in age, intelligence and religion, and the companionship of pious people is recommended. Spiritual solitude is different from mere isolation and it is a kind of ḣiṭṭāq (seclusion) that is not restricted to the mosque. The period recommended for solitude varies from ten days to forty days according to the different Prophetic traditions. The purpose of this solitude is purification of heart and a shyakh is necessary for guidance through it. Actually, worship, gnosis and asceticism are different forms of piety and all are interrelated with each other. Consistent performance of obligatory acts leads to the proximity of God and invocation is the best way to reach Him as He said: “Remember Me; I remember you.”

This is the greatest miracle and pre-eminence. Zarrūq maintains that the light of invocation burns the attributes of man and stimulates luminosity in the heart. Therefore, the prayers upon the Prophet with invocations are recommended, because prayers upon the Prophet are like water that strengthen the spirit and smother the fire of the ego.

Chapter Eleven: This chapter consists of ten principles. It states the importance of personal prayers and invocation, the validity of its performance both out loud and silently; in isolation and in assembly; as well as outlining its different methods and their conditions.

Zarrūq elaborates the importance of personal prayer. He evaluates its underlying wisdom alongside a discussion of belief in the pre-determination of destiny. He concludes that personal prayer is a kind of worship that is commanded by God. Personal prayers and invocation are both equal acts of worship and each one can substitute the other. A ruling which is for a general case does not apply to a particular case. An argument is necessary for the imposition of a specific upon a particular case. The matter of assembling for invocations and performance of personal prayer loudly falls under this observation. Affirmation of a ruling for a particular case does not generalise it because the basic principle is prohibition until evidence for validity is adduced/put forward. Zarrūq elaborates the validity of assembling for invocation, personal prayers and recitation. He further asserts that the excellence of something is not evidence for its superiority. Assembling for invocation, personal prayers and recitation is recommended by the sunnah but the Prophet joined the circle of scholars and preferred them over a gathering of invocation, because of its greater benefit.

Zarrūq opines that time and space play an important role in the formulation of legal rulings. Some acceptable acts are declared as prohibited or reprehensible because of contextual consideration. Zarrūq views that assembling for invocation is to be prohibited either on the basis of the elimination of means (to wrong doing) or the rejection of reprehensible innovation. He further argues that if the validity of something is conditional, then all of its conditions must be observed. Thus, there are
three conditions in assembling for invocation: i) free time after the performance of obligations ii) absence of prohibited or reprehensible acts iii) observing the etiquettes of invocation.

Natural inclination towards any religious activity is praiseworthy. Zarrūq states that usage of invocation for worldly purposes for instance recitation of sūrah al-wāqi‘ah to combat poverty is lawful.\(^{28}\) Al-Būnī and the like hold the same opinion about the invocation of the various names of God and their respective merits. Otherwise, according to the basic principle, one should not make the invocation for worldly achievements. There is a particular merit in the meanings of every word and invocation that requires a special method of performance; and its secret lies in the number of its prescribed repetitions and its benefit is according to the spiritual states of the invoker. Zarrūq writes that the particular numbers of invocations are relevant and rosary beads are useful in the performance of invocation.\(^{29}\)

\textbf{Chapter Twelve:}\ This chapter consists of eighteen principles. It examines the validity of Sufi audition, poetry and ecstasy, seeking blessing from objects and articles belonging to righteous people.

Zarrūq devises a principle that whatever is allowed for a reason, or a specific or common cause is not be generalized in all cases. Therefore the deduction of the permissibility of Sufi audition from singing at celebrations is invalid. There are three opinions about the things before the Law: caution, permission and prohibition. Audition is to be examined under this law and Sufis like the jurists have three different opinions on the matter. It is a reprehensible innovation to believe that a certain act will lead to the proximity of God, where in fact it does not do so. No one recommends audition, and those who validate it, do so only on the basis of necessity. Therefore this condition should be observed otherwise the act is prohibited. Zarrūq argues that audition is of benefit only for those who are truly involved and it aids their spiritual illumination. A man is benefited only when he is attentive in all spiritual states. Al-Shāfi‘ī said: “The beauty in poetry is truly beautiful, and its vileness is truly vile.”\(^{30}\)

Zarrūq states that if a Gnostic confesses to a deficiency in his knowledge then his statements should be accepted, because he is nonetheless truthful. The prohibition of something due to a particular obstruction or with justification does not eliminate its principle ruling (of validity). The leading later Sufis and majority of jurists believe in the prohibition of audition because of the context of innovations and heresies. Some people reject it because a ruling of illegality is effectively an elimination of all means for an act. Zarrūq asserts that anything that is allowed out of necessity is restricted within the bounds and all of its conditions are to be taken into account. It is easy to benefit from those acts which are harmonious with one’s natural inclinations. Stories and poetry attract people and refers to esoteric realities. However there are three
conditions for their validity. If an act is permissible by a set of conditions, then these conditions must be fulfilled for its legitimacy. The conditions are: i) consideration of companions, time and place ii) free time after performance of religious obligations iii) sincerity.

Zarrūq notes that poetry, admiration and allusion are signs of distance from the contemplation of God. In the presence of the Divine Majesty, the soul cannot maintain affirmation of itself. Therefore the leading Sufis such as al-Junayd, ‘Abd al-Qādir, al-Shādhili produced very little poetic work. It has been said that Sufi audition is prohibited for a man who knows that his consciousness will be dominated by audition. A person in rapture and ecstasy (al-wājīd) is excused because he is in a state where he cannot contain himself. The ruling concerning insane persons are to be applied on him in this state.

Zarrūq explains the value and reality of the allusions which a man perceives during his ecstasy must be considered from the point of view of one possessing complete realisation, otherwise it is preferable for a man of faith to follow a safer method. The imitation of Sufis in their actions and practices is permissible such as wearing the patched frock, carrying prayer beads, a staff and a prayer mat and dying one’s hair. However it is prohibited for a man whose aim is trickery and deceit. The miracles of the pious men produce evidence for their sincerity. It is permissible to seek the blessing of righteous people whose miracles have manifested.31

Chapter Thirteen: This chapter consists of twenty four principles. It explains mainly on two topics: 1- Sufi rituals and their legal status such as the donning of the patched frock, using rosary beads, initiation, visiting graves seeking grace etc. 2- Theological debates such as miracles, intersection, intuition, discernment in affair and emulation of the pious.

Zarrūq states that expressions and conversation are important to understand a man. The inner self of a person is recognized from his outward state because what is in the heart reflects on the face. Zarrūq states that the understanding of a man is by three things: his words, behaviour, and nature, when he is angered. Every region has its divergent manifestation of good and bad. A sign of pious man is that he stays away from the bad qualities of his region. A general rule is not implemented in specific cases. Good people will exist everywhere and for all times. However, infallibility is only for the Prophets. The character of a man is examined on the basis of predominant aspects of goodness in his states. Supernatural events are to be examined on the basis of the character of their originator. If his religiosity is sound then it is a miracle; otherwise it is trickery or magic.

It is commanded not to pass a judgement on the matter about which one has no knowledge. Zarrūq states that the excellence of something does not require its
superiority/preference over another; otherwise, one has to confess the pre-eminence of Iblīs on the common people on the basis of his extraordinary qualities. Therefore emulation is not valid except for a person whose knowledge and religiosity has been established. The evaluation of times and peoples, not on the grounds of sacred law, is of the pre-Islamic traditions/practices. The non-believers raised the objection of why the Qurʾān was not sent down to a man of greater tribal nobility of the two cities. Actually prophethood is a special blessing, as is sainthood. The greatness of a man is perceived from his standing with God. It is significant to respect all those who have a relationship with God until they violate a clear ruling of Sacred Law. All great people were afflicted with different adversities and they persistently desired the pleasure of God. Tranquillity is a state of peace of mind in all alarming and terrible circumstances. As far as the validity of intercession is concerned, Zarrūq argues that nobody can intercede before God except with His permission. It has been ordered to find out the means of reaching Him. It has been said that these means are the belief in God, or obedience to the Prophet of God, or the good deeds of a man.

Regarding Sufi rituals, Zarrūq describes the importance of the patched frock, prayer beads, the oath and the handshake. He relates a Prophetic tradition to prove the validity of these rituals. Any action is valid which has sound and clear authority from tradition such as visiting graveyards. He also emphasizes the observation of proper conduct during these visits. The argument which is based on probability leads to definite certitude, but it does not necessarily apply in all circumstances. Discernment in Sacred Law is a light of faith. One who possesses it can discern the inner states of people. It can be achieved by purification of heart.

Zarrūq reveals that God helps the servant in his inability to manage his interests; and love of the people is attained by staying away from what belongs to them. Therefore laymen prefer the ascetics over the scholars and Gnostics. A man who acts upon the obligatory actions accurately and praises God, He grants him general acceptance amongst people. The respect of religion for the pleasure of God is the intention of a true seeker, and purification of intention is essential otherwise there is an abuse of religion. Leaving an obligatory act due to the praise or criticism of people is in fact departing the Truth for them and this is condemnable.

Zarrūq argues that the manifestation of miracles and keeping them secret is assessed according to its principle and practical application. Some people manifest miracles while others keep them secret. Understanding of the commandment to combat the lower self is very important. A man who knows the arrogance of the self but persistently follows its commands remains distantly from the path to truth. Thinking well about the people is a positive idea that leads to goodness. The blessing of God purifies the hearts of His saints. They have to interact with other people to carry out their needs. Therefore, at the beginning of the spiritual path a saint is given what he desires, but not at the end when his heart is completely preoccupied by God and he desires nothing other than what his Lord desires for him.
Chapter Fourteen: This chapter consists of twenty four principles. It describes different ethical and moral aspects and defines ethical terminologies such as good and bad, generosity and avarice, envy and goodwill, anger and tranquillity, and how to nullify bad moral and acquire good morals.

Zarrūq states that God is perfect and perfection comes only through His blessing. No one is perfect except Him. Thus, imperfection is in the origin while perfection is supplementary. Poverty and wealth are two existing features. The second feature is from the qualities of God. Therefore this is preferable. If a man is in the state of affluence and prosperity with God (al-ghinā bi-Allāh) then he manifests many miracles and if he is in the state of poverty with God then his tongue becomes dull while there is a group of people who are in a higher station and they are more perfect.

Zarrūq recommends moderation and states that in reality, man is not the owner of worldly things, he is just a manager. Therefore both parsimony and extravagance are forbidden. Renunciation is passive behaviour towards something in a way that its existence or extinction does not affect one’s heart. Al-Shādhili says: I saw Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddiq in dream and he said: “The sign of the love of this world leaving the heart is to spend when one is in possession (of wealth) and to feel tranquil at the separation (from wealth).” Whatever is condemned for a reason that is not linked to its fundamental nature may be praised for the same reason; examples here include wealth, status and leadership. The condemnation and praise of these things are based on their consequences and not on their essence. Declaring the permissibility of a prohibited thing to avert a merely reprehensible matter is not valid. Therefore the Sufi is not concerned with praising people for one reason or another.

Zarrūq asserts that complete intention of heart towards God is required in all states. Therefore negation of ostentation, arrogance and greediness is obligatory to attain sincerity, gratitude and trust in God. Hindrances are not harmful to the seekers if they possess true intention. One should not leave or abandon a recommended thing for fear of ostentation. It is necessary to establish the arguments to nullify the aspirations of the ego and doubts. Waswasah is from Satan and one should keep one’s attention away from it. After gaining the realization the states of sincerity, disclosure or concealment of actions do not come into effect, but before this stage one must fear ostentation. Zarrūq defines deceit (al-madāhinah), courtesy (al-madārah) and differentiates between gift and bribery. He says that these four things are difficult to discern in some cases. One should be very careful about them.

Zarrūq defines moral character (khulq) as a state of being from which manners/habits flow easily and it manifests itself in opposites such as rapacity and generosity. The ethics of the self are not to be examined by external accidents, except from whence they indicate these internal characteristics. For example rapacity is a burden while
generosity is a pleasure at the time of giving. These are states of mind and it is not necessary that a generous man gives something to be generous. Moral characters are examined by the intention in their performance. Greed is reprehensible, however if one is greedy to seek the trust of God then it is praiseworthy. The envy is referred back to stiffness of the inner self and the intention of the envious is to ruin all that another person has. One should repulse evil with a graceful manner.

Zarrūq argues that the implementation of penalties and holy battles is to maintain order and it is an act of mercy for both parties if it is for the sake of spreading the word of God and establishing order and spreading faith. Anger is an ignition in the heart. A Sufi disciple must observe careful behaviour in this state. Invalidation of bad morals by purposely doing their opposites is the wisdom of religion. Tranquillity (al-ʿāfiyah) is a state of peace and calmness whether for a specific reason or not. If it is from the grace of God then it is perfect tranquilly otherwise it is its opposite, that is, a tribulation. Tranquillity is set according to the spiritual state of the individual. Zarrūq advises that one should be patient (sābin) in suffering. In the early days of Islam, Muslims had to face many hardships such as exile and other adversities. Thus everyone who desires perfection has to face difficulties. High morals are to be acquired by the elimination of their opposites and it can be sought through consistent training.  

Chapter Fifteen: This chapter consists of thirteen principles. It describes different Sufi states and stations, subjective thoughts and their sources and significance of Sufi anecdotes and symbolism.

Zarrūq asserts that admitting one’s faults and the blessings of God without following all that entails from them is a great hindrance to attaining realization. The purpose of both acknowledgements ought to be realization of deficiencies and extending gratitude to God. The advantage of examining the faults of the ego, and perceiving the intricacies of one’s states, is to understand one’s imperfection and become humble with God. However it is beyond one’s capability to eradicate all their deficiencies.

Zarrūq proclaims that understanding of subjective thoughts is significant for the men of contemplation to negate disruptions of the heart. There are four kinds of subjective thoughts: divine (rabbānī), psychic (nafsānī), angelic (malakī), and satanic (shayṭānī). Stories and anecdotes have a great impact on the listener. Similarly poetry has strong effects but usually it strengthens the ego. Anyone who affirms his own excellence and denies the qualities in others is in fact degrading his own qualities.

Zarrūq asserts that that it is necessary to be cautious about the transmission of information otherwise its words may be forged. Correct usage of a word is necessary to find out the correct meaning of the word and understanding its correct meaning is necessary to express its true spirit, otherwise in the first instance the speaker himself
may have been misguided, and in the second he may misguide someone else. Furthermore, the wisdom of the usage of symbolism and the disjoined letters (muqatta‘ī). Symbols are used to convey a comprehensive meaning in a few letters or words. The knowledge can be examined by its acceptance and refutation. Similarly spiritual experience can be evaluated through the affirmation and denunciation of one’s spiritual states. There is no fixed rule except what is from God. The religious scholars examine acts and determine their legal position. They classify the acts into obligatory, invalid, recommended, reprehensible and acceptable. Thus it is obligatory to follow their principles without deviation from the Truth. The responsibilities are according to the states of a man. The fundamental rule of Sufism is following what is best.

Zarrūq claims that the Sufi worldview endorses everything which attaches the heart to its Lord. Therefore when al-Junayd was asked about the Sufi audition he replied: “Everything that leads a servant to his Lord is recommended.” Zarrūq states this condition must be observed in the Sufi audition. Worship is nothing but luminosity and union while disobedience is entirely obscurity and deviation and there is an area of confusion between the two (worship and disobedient). One should stay away from doubts and obscurities.

Chapter Sixteen: This chapter consists of ten principles. It explains the criticism of Sufi rituals, practices, ecstatic remarks (shaṭaḥāt) and their analysis.

Zarrūq states that seeking realization with sincerity leads generally to a relaxation in outward worship without neglecting obligatory acts. Thus, it is observed that some Sufis engaged in reprehensible practices and uttered ecstatic remarks (shaṭaḥāt). Therefore the leading Sufis recommend observing fundamentals of the Sacred Law to get rid of doubts and criticism. Zarrūq argues that a Sufi overlooks the commandments related to the human conduct during his spiritual states and engages in prohibited practices and utters ecstatic remarks. Therefore, it is necessary to keep the company of a pious jurist for advice and guidance. Because of the strangeness and subtle realities, there are many pretenders on this Path. Therefore religious scholars advise to stay away from this path.

Zarrūq affirms that Sufism is not valid without jurisprudence and a jurist Sufi is in a perfect state in contrast to the opposite. Refutation averts the acceptance of a refuted act and affirmation is the key to the act which is affirmed. A thing is rejected on the basis of independent judgement, or to block the means to it, or because of a lack of understanding, or due to ignorance or obstinacy. All these ways of criticism are a reference to the reality except the last one. Zarrūq states that the criticism of Abū Ḥayyān and Ibn al-Jawzī is to block the means. Zarrūq advises that explicating the deficiencies of someone in confidence is advice, but propagating it publicly is scandal and no one has any right to humiliate or disgrace any one. The preservation of religion is preferred over the preservation of supplementary elements. Therefore
criticism on *isnad* (the chain of *hadith* transmitters) and in the community affairs is recommended. The criticism of Ibn Jawzī of Sufism is also in this regard but he exceeded the limits. Therefore, the men of the path repudiated him, otherwise his book is beneficial.\(^ {37} \)

**Chapter Seventeen:** This chapter consists of nineteen principles. It evaluates and examines the nature of the criticisms against Sufism and suggests self-analysis, piety and performance of litanies regularly.

Zarrūq states five reasons for the repudiation of Sufis: i) The indulgence of some Sufis in special dispensation and their misbehaviour ii) Sensitivity of the observer iii) Existence of false pretenders iv) Fear of misguidance of laymen v) Desire of some Sufis for acclaim. He states every one of the above mentioned categories are rewarded or excused except the last one. Nevertheless, the books that have been written to renounce Sufi doctrine and their teachings are valuable because they caution against the mistakes and errors of Sufism.

The claim of a claimant is evaluated by the result of his claim. If the result matches his claims then he is truthful, otherwise he is a liar. Zarrūq describes the different spiritual states and their results to evaluate the claims of individuals, such as repentance without piety being void. He defines fear (*khashīyah*), fright (*khawf*), hope (*rajā`) love (*hubb*) and states these are the motivators to action. He asserts that lover is not happy to disobey his beloved. Therefore if anyone who commits an error should hurry to repentance.

Zarrūq opines that realization is achieved by the blessing of God and every aspect of the *shari`ah* is also an esoteric reality. Therefore one should follow the *sunnah* entirely Negligence in self-examination yields consistency in error. Therefore self-examination is compulsory for rectification of errors. The perception and realization of things is the sign of life and a dead man does not realize anything. Similarly a live heart becomes happy by doing virtuous acts, and gloomy by committing sins. One should seek knowledge of the *shari`ah*. The Messenger is the leader. Any *shaykh* who is not well-established in the *sunnah* is not one to be followed even if he has performed thousands upon thousands of miracles. The recitation of litanies is necessary for every true disciple. If he could not perform them in time due to some reason, he should carry them out later consistently without insincere exaggeration therein.

Zarrūq argues that everything has a strong affiliation with what it belongs to. Therefore the remembrance of a Sufi is long-lasting in contrast to a jurist because the jurist lives with his knowledge and whereas the pious man lives with God. Veneration is determined by what God has venerated and its denigration sometimes leads to blasphemy. Therefore it is wrong to say that we do not worship Him out of
A Comprehension of Zarrūq’s Qawā’id al-Taṣawwuf

fear of hell or the desire of paradise. The believers are commanded to ask for paradise and seek refuge in Him from hell-fire.38

Epilogue:
Zarrūq relates the advice of his Shaykh Abū al-‘Abbās al-Ḥadramī that a novice must follow the Book and sunnah in his deeds and in all three dimensions regarding the divine, personal and human interaction. He elaborates upon these and advises the renunciation of reprehensible innovations, legal dispensations, doubts, and usage of esoteric knowledge for worldly benefits. He emphasizes self-examination and the purification of the heart for the validity of acts. He recommends the books of Ibn ʿAṭāʾ Allāh for esoteric knowledge, particularly his book al-Tanwīr and the books of Ibn Abī Jamrah and al-Madkhal of Ibn al-Ḥajj for exoteric knowledge. He relates some Prophetic traditions and in the end he prays for the grant of success and invokes blessings upon the Prophet and his family.39 We have attempted to present a content study of Qawā’id al-Taṣawwūf that helps a reader ascertain Zarrūq’s Sufi approach and his methodology applied in his masterpiece.

References:
1 Some important sources of Zarrūq’s life and work:

2 al-Ḳūhīn, Ṭabaqāt al-Shādhiliyyah, p. 20.
4 Zarruq, Qawā’id al-Taṣawwūf, (MS no. 3031 PM.547 the Koniglichen Bibliothek zu Berlin), folio: 2a.
5 Zarruq, Qawā’id, (MS No. 3031 PM. 547), folio: 2a.
7 Q6/ al-Anʿām. 52.
14 Al-Bukhārī, Ṣahīh, kitāb al-kifālah (39), bāb al-kifālah fi al-fard, ḥadīth no. 2291.
16 Q8/ al-Anfāl and Q3/ Āl ʿImrān. 7.
19 Muslim, Ṣahīh, kitāb al-īmān, (1) bāb al-īmān wa-al-islām wa-al-ihṣān…, ḥadīth no. 93.
22 Zarruq, Qawāʾid al-Taṣawwūf, pp. 82-93.
23 Zarruq, Qawāʾid al-Taṣawwūf, pp. 94-102.
24 Muslim, Ṣahīh, kitāb al-zakāh, (32) bāb biyān anna al-yad al-ʿulūyā khayr min al-yad suflā, ḥadīth no. 2387.
A Comprehension of Zarrūq’s Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf

26 Q2/ al-Baqrah. 152.
27 Zarrūq, Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf, vol. 2, pp. 112-121.
29 Zarrūq, Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf, vol. 2, pp. 122-136
31 Zarrūq, Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf, vol.1, pp. 137-152.
38 Zarrūq, Qawā‘id al-Taṣawwuf, vol. 2, pp. 223-234.
Religious Locale and Inter-Religions
Demographic Structure of Colonial Multan

*Muhammad Shafique
**Muhammad Javed Akhtar
***Lubna Kanwal

Abstract
Most of the problems of modern state and society have been associated with the cultural norms which, it is believed, are the product of the demographic structure of the society. In this way, the study of the demographic structure of a society becomes essential, especially when the demographic composition is not homogeneous. The paper explores the demographic composition of Multan during the British colonial period on racial, religious and professional models with a thematic assumption that Multan has been a multi-ethnic, multi-cultural and multi-religions centre since ancient times and a spiritual religious character has been dominating the city. The Demography of Multan represented Central Asian, Middle Eastern, Indian, Persian and European flocks as well as Hindu, Muslim, Sikh, Parsee and Jew following. It concludes that this multi-ethnic and multi-religious character has contributed potentially to the formation of ‘Multani Culture’. Inspite of racial and professional identities operating within the cultural symbols, there was a strong spiritual-religious affiliation among the different groups of society. However, this was neither religious homogeneity nor religious bigotry rather it was a sort religious liberty that kept Multani society and culture intact.

1. Introduction
Multan has been considered one of the most ancient living centers of civilization in the world. Its antiquity reflects a long history of interaction and intermingling of different ethnic, racial and religious communities of the world. Representing medieval structure of urban planning, settlement and administration, religiosity of demographic structure of Multan during the colonial period was more complex than the traditional tribal/caste and vocational stratification of medieval society and even more independent from the feudal and estates structure of rural agrarian culture. It was an epitome of a multi-cultural, multi-racial, multi-ethnic and multi-religious societal composition, having guild interests, mostly same as those of castes and clans’ ties in the rural and agriarian societies of medieval world. This heterogeneous compound, by the time, took the form of a new culture specific to the city, known for the tolerant, tendered, and mystical-spiritual behavior of the people of the city, having affinity with all those who come to join the inhabitants of the city.
Although modern theories of race deny the concept of purity of blood of any racial group in the now current world, the paper focuses on the theme that demographically Multan city has never been a strong hold of any one racial, ethnic or religious group since ancient times, until the emergence of Pakistan. In spite of some popular assumptions promoted by some leading experts of antiquity that during the ancient times the region was populated by ‘Malhi’ or ‘Malohi’ tribe of central India, the paper argues that the religious and mythological status of the city was more prominent than its tribal status during the ancient times. Even the racial and tribal interpretations were dominated by religious and mythological aspects of ‘Sun worship’, which was a popular creed all over the world until the emergence of Islam.

For, the paper approaches the locale of the Multan in the traditional world and its impact on the demographic structure of the city. This approach is supported by the classification and analysis of the demographic statistics of Multan during the pre-independence colonial period.

2. Locale of Multan in the Traditional World

The demographic structure of Multan is the product of the historical, mythological, political and cultural locale the city has maintained within its physical-geography. The traditional world was based on mythological-religious foundations; therefore, locale of Multan in the traditional world was determined by a mythological-religious outlook which was supported by six major aspects:

First: The Antiquarian Status of the City
Second: Geographic locale of the city
Third: Commercial Centre
Fourth: Religious Sanctification
Fifth: International Rout Links.
Sixth: Spread of Modern Religions

2.1. The Antiquarian Status of the City

Multan has been considered one of the most ancient living cities of the world. The archaeological excavations in and around Multan during the second half of nineteenth century and the through out the twentieth centuries confirm that Multan has been a centre of civilization since ancient times. However, by the times of the Greeks, one can found the written record of the state of society and its interaction with the other societies. This record, in the form of indigenous Scripture and Greek, Chinese and Muslim Travelogue texts, provides sufficient examples to believe in the permanent existence of the city on the world map and continuous flow of population in Multan and from Multan to other parts of the world. In this perspective, one can find the evidence of Aryan, Greek, Arab, Turks, Scythians, Persians, Baloches, Mughals, Afghans, Rajputs, Africans, Jats, Maratha, Pathans and other races’ interaction and influence on the region and demography of the region. This permanent existence on the map has made Multan a best place to the study of cultural and racial inter-mingling and religious interaction from the most ancient to the recent times. Geographic locale, status as commercial centre and religious
significance, provide support to each other, all form the crust of the antiquarian status of the city.

2.2. Geographic Locale of Multan.

The geographic locale of Multan seems to be the key to understand the demographic structure of Multan city. Located at 30 11 44 North and 71 28 31 East on geographic coordinates, it is a tropical hot region. However, Multan seems to be the central place between Harappa and Mohenjodaro, two renowned centers of ancient civilizations. Surrounded by four big rivers, Ravi, Chenab, Indus and Sutlej, the region has been well known for its agrarian products and handicrafts related to its agriculture. Multan city served as a market center for this economy. The economic prosperity of the region and the tolerant behavior of its inhabitants assigned it a mythological status and made it a meeting point for the adjacent civilizations: Persia, Central Asia, Middle East and India.

2.3. Status as Commercial Centre

The geographic locale and the agricultural produces made Multan a best place for trade in the region. As the other areas of the region were under strong tribal control, therefore independent status of Multan became a route cause of the promotion of trade and commerce in the city and the emergence of Multan as a commercial centre. The merchants of different areas of Arabia, Central Asia, Persia, Hindostan, Bengal, Rajhistan, Guzrat, Makran and Sind established permanent contacts with the city.

2.4. Religious Sanctification

Multan has mythological-religious sanctity since very remote age. This status brings to light a variety of mythological influences developing in Multan city. These influences made Multan a permanent centre of pilgrimage and people from all around the world began to come to Multan. Religious festivals can be supposed to be providing a centre of activity for trade, commerce and immigration during the medieval times. This demographic theme seems to be supported by the view of status of Multan as an ancient trade centre.

The ancient world view is considered to be based on Fire, Sun and Light worship and Sun worship is supposed to be the only universal phenomena of then known world. Multan is considered to be the one major centre of the Sun worship. The following table shows that almost all except one interpretation of the old names of the Multan link it with the tradition of sun-worship. As the sun was considered to be the source of life and source of purification of earth from impurity of the worldly behaviour, therefore, it was a sacred centre for those who believed in Sun-god. The old known names attached with the city to recognize it confirm these speculations.
Table: 11

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Old Name</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Malli/Malohi/Maluvasthan</td>
<td>The city of Malaya tribe who worshipped Sun god</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Kasyapapura</td>
<td>The origin-land of Sun gods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Hanspura</td>
<td>The land of Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Bagapura</td>
<td>the land of Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Parhaladpura</td>
<td>City of Parhalad (god)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Adysthana</td>
<td>The land of Sun god</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Kaspapurose</td>
<td>The city of Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Kaspaturose</td>
<td>The city of Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Kasperia</td>
<td>The city of Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Sambapura</td>
<td>The city of the worshiper of Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Mulsthanapura</td>
<td>The city of god of sun Rays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Sauvira</td>
<td>The land of great heroes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The prosperity of the city and the region and the mythological-religious creed of Sun-worship had made the city popular in adjacent world as the belief in Sun-god was not only popular among the trans-Sutlej Hindustani mythology, but also more spiritually was followed by the Persians and Middles Eastern communities and even among the Greeko-Roman world which linked the city with these regions. The people around the world had not only contact with the city, but also had a general tendency of migration towards Multan city either because of its religious sanctity or due to its commercial importance.

It appears that religion and economy had constructed the demographic foundations of Multan city. It naturally made Multan a central point of caravan-routes, either of Pilgrims or of traders and linked it with all major centers of civilizations. The immigration in Multan and emigration from Multan contributed potentially in the development of a permanent demographic structure of the city. Therefore, not only the trans-Sutlej communities from the East, but also trans-Indus
ReligiousLocale and Inter-Religions Demographic Structure of Colonial Multan

Communities from the West were used to take their ways to Multan to pay their tribute to the deities recognized and associated with this venerated place. Resultantly, immigration and emigration became a permanent part of Multani demography. As permanent population remained very much confined to the traditional religious class, therefore, Multan provided an extended space for the intermingling of religious, ethnic and racial communities and for the development of a compound culture, especially, represented by its language having the ability to pronounce every phonetic composition of the world languages. This compound provided a landscape for the settlement of any group intending to maintain its individuality or wishing to merge in the main-stream compound of culture. It reflected a high level of tolerance, coherence, intermingling, interaction and resultantly veneration among the people and races inhabited around the region.

2.5. International Route Links

The presentation of Multan merely as a city of main stream trade route does not reflect the status of the city properly; rather it was a centre for pilgrims also. There were so many routes established to link Multan with Central Asia, Afghanistan, Persia, Arabia in the North West and to link Delhi, Rajputana, Gujrat and Sind in the South and East. These links developed a demographic pattern which was based on the inter-mixture of different races and religions. Through the status as a religious and trade centre, Multan city performed the functions of a caravan route-junction, where all routes and caravans from all around had to come, exchange their goods for barter and had to take their ways back or forward. During the middle ages, Multan was a junction linking a number of main routes serving for the demographic changes in the region, such as:

1. Multan-Quetta/Qandahar route: linking Multan through Kurram and Gomal Passes with Afghanistan and Central Asia and Persia.
2. Multan-Quetta-Persia Route: Linking Multan with Persia and Central Asia
3. Multan-Gomal Pass-Central Asia Route: Linking Multan with Central Asian religions and races
5. Chennab-Indus Water Channel: linking Multan with Middle East and Persian Gulf through Arabian Sea.
7. Multan-Delhi Road: linking Multan with Hindustan through Delhi.
8. Grand Trunk Road: linking Multan with Northern India and Bengal.
9. Multan-Abohar Route: linking Multan with trans-Sutlej Cholistan, Rajasthan, Sind and Guzrat

A mass of people continued to immigrate into and emigrate from Multan since ancient times; however, the process appears to be taking the form of a visible or prominent scene at certain stages of history. Being a meeting point for civilizations of India, Persia, Central Asia and Middle East, its history has no traces of tribal
warfare, rather a place where imperial powers collided to achieve control over the adjacent regions as well as wealth. Therefore its demography represented a multi-cultural and multi-ethnic configuration or compound racial contents. However, the city of Multan can be considered a centre for refuge during the time of turmoil. The major races who took up this city for their political and power exploits were martial races. All major evidences of history from the time of Alexander of Macedonia in 321 B.C. to our current time in the twentieth century confirm this theory at large.\textsuperscript{15}

2.6. The Emergence and Spread of Modern Religions.

The demographic links and religious veneration had begun to develop new cultural-religious discourse in the region since very ancient times. The cultural religiosity found in the Harrappan and Mohenjodaran civilizations and emergence of Hinduism and Buddhism seem to be the result of this interaction. Although, the Buddhism’s nature mystical behaviour was very much close to the spiritual character of the region, no strong traces of Buddhism can be found in and around Multan. However, mythological Hinduism got itself established deeply in the region. The identity of the city attached with the Sun-god shifted its association to Hindu deities\textsuperscript{16} who had also placed indigenously established Sun-god (Suriya) at a high place of religious festivity.\textsuperscript{17}

The penetration of indigenous deities faced a new wave of cultural influence by the third century B.C. from Greeko- Bactrians, Persian Central-Asian cultural invasion followed by the races under the influence of Islam. First invasion brought Zoroastrian-Persians’ religion. This impact dominated by the Deities of Sun and Fire and second wave of invasion brought Islamic religions in the region. Both left a strong impact on the culture and religion of the area.\textsuperscript{18} Very soon Islam became the largest followed religion. Its interaction with the indigenous culture introduced new forms of spirituality in the form of Sufism and Indian Islam. Multan became a great centre of Muslim mysticism.\textsuperscript{19} This combination resulted in the emergence of a new indigenous religion known as Sikhism. However, Christianity was introduced by the imperial masters and remained aligned with ruling elites and never became able to establish its foundations in the culture of the region. The status of the city as a centre of inter-cultural, inter-religious activity can be found universal throughout the history.

3. People on the Move Under the British

As we have discussed there has been a constant flow of people to and from Multan since ancient times. The process of ethnic and cultural interaction became accelerated during the British colonial times, due to the introduction of modern moods of transportation especially Railway. On the other hand, Multan emerged as a major out-post of British Empire in the South-West of India especially towards central Asia, Middle East, Afghanistan and Persia. Following table provides the figures of immigrants and emigrants from Multan, during the last fifty years of British rule.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Migration\textsuperscript{20}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Census Year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Religious Locale and Inter-Religions Demographic Structure of Colonial Multan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Hindu</th>
<th>Sikh</th>
<th>Jain</th>
<th>Muslim</th>
<th>Christian</th>
<th>Parsee</th>
<th>Jew</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>68674</td>
<td>29962</td>
<td>661</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>36294</td>
<td>1711</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>74562</td>
<td>32130</td>
<td>961</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>39765</td>
<td>1672</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>87394</td>
<td>36947</td>
<td>1588</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>46899</td>
<td>1777</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911</td>
<td>99243</td>
<td>38341</td>
<td>2659</td>
<td>388</td>
<td>55686</td>
<td>2105</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>84806</td>
<td>25339</td>
<td>1573</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>55864</td>
<td>1955</td>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1931</td>
<td>119457</td>
<td>40424</td>
<td>2960</td>
<td>424</td>
<td>72134</td>
<td>1823</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table indicates that there was so continuous a flow of immigrants and emigrants that balance of demographic composition was maintained. It is however to be explored that what was the nature of settlement.

**4. Religio-Demographic Taxonomy of Colonial Multan**

Demographically, the population of Multan city has been classified in three ways. Foremost important classification was based on tribe/caste, religion and profession. Although tribe and profession marked the foundation of distinction and identity, nature of the religion and culture has a profound impact on the determination of profession of a religious group. Every tribe and professional groups had a further division based on their belief system. In most of the cases, the three divisions were combined into one major concept of identity.

As a multi-ethnic and multi-cultural centre of religious and trade activity, Multan was populated by all popular religions of the world by the end of nineteenth century, except that of the followers of the Buddhism. It is probable that Buddhist had been converted to Islam on the traditional pattern of conversion in the Indus valley after the Muslim conquest of the region as Multan had become a centre of Sufi activity which were very close to the spiritual norms of Budhism. However, Hindus, Sikhs, Janis, Muslims, Christians, Parsees and Jews were found here in the Multan. These religious groups were further divided into sects. The following table shows the population of various religious groups in the censuses of India from 1881 to 1931.

**Table of Religious Demography**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Hindu</th>
<th>Sikh</th>
<th>Jain</th>
<th>Muslim</th>
<th>Christian</th>
<th>Parsee</th>
<th>Jew</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>68674</td>
<td>29962</td>
<td>661</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>36294</td>
<td>1711</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>74562</td>
<td>32130</td>
<td>961</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>39765</td>
<td>1672</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>87394</td>
<td>36947</td>
<td>1588</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>46899</td>
<td>1777</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911</td>
<td>99243</td>
<td>38341</td>
<td>2659</td>
<td>388</td>
<td>55686</td>
<td>2105</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>84806</td>
<td>25339</td>
<td>1573</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>55864</td>
<td>1955</td>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1931</td>
<td>119457</td>
<td>40424</td>
<td>2960</td>
<td>424</td>
<td>72134</td>
<td>1823</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Among these religious groups, Hindus and Muslims were the major groups inhabiting Multan. However Muslims not only formed a definite majority, but also increased their strength in number during the first half of the twentieth century under the imperial administration. According to the population census of 1881, the population of the Muslims was 52.84 % of the total population of Multan city and Hindus formed 43.63 % of the total population of the city. The population of Hindus decreased in terms of fraction, according to the census report of 1891 especially due to a minimum level conversion of Hindus to Christianity, therefore the population of
Muslims increased in fractions in comparison with the Hindus. However, all Jew population seems to had migrated and no census evidence of existence of Jews after 1891 is available in documents.

Indication of the widening demographic difference between Hindu and Muslim Population can be found by the end of nineteenth century. The Muslim population began to increase and Hindu population began to decline. The epidemic of plague before the census of 1921 brought to focus major demographic shift in Multan city which was strongly supported by the Hindu-Muslim communal riots in the 1920s. This structure continued until the partition of India plan 1947. The epidemic decreased the population of Multan to 84806 in 1921 as compare to 1911 census report’s figures of 99243. The Muslims maintained their population. However Hindus population decreased significantly as 38341 in 1911 to 25339 in 1921. Their population declined to 30% against 43% of total population in 1891. The Muslims became 66% of the total population. By the census of 1931, the Hindus could maintain only 33% of total population, but Muslims got their share in population established at 60% which remained firm until 1947. However almost all Jain population got shifted towards South of India.

The migration chart indicates that the population of Pathans increased rapidly after the epidemic of Plague. The gape of migration of Hindus at a large scale was filled by them.

4.1. Religious Taxonomy of Castes and Clans

Religious/ Communal divide was a major demographic fact, yet Multani society was based on professional caste and clan system, having distinction of customs, traditions and rituals. As it was a multi-cultural society, therefore most of the dominant castes and clan had a history of migration from the different parts of the world. Although the people, who had migrated from the trans-Sutlej South and East regions, were mostly Hindus and people who had come from the trans-Indus North and West, were considered to be Muslim. However there were a number of castes and clans who had almost equal following of Hinduism and Islam. The following categories indicates the communal division of castes and clans in the Multan:

**Hindu Castes and Clans:** Arora, Arya, Brahmin, Bagaria, Khattri, Bhabhra, Chimar, Churra, Kori, Ood.

**Muslim Castes and Clans:** Khoja, Khokhar, Shaikh, Marth, Mughal, Pathan, Qureshi, Syed, Biloch, Chishti, Daudpotra, Arain

These caste and clans had universal adherence of Hindu or Muslim religious creed and rituals. Brahmins were Hindu theologians functioning as mediators between the supernatural deities and the common masses. Arora, Khitris and Bagaria were Hindus’ commercial classes and others were professional classes of Hindus. They all religiously were connected with the South and North India. The Brahmins formed one of the major Hindu groups residing in the towns consisted almost 20% of total Hindu population of the city. Their major castes were Sarsut and
Pushkarna. Khattris formed near about 10% of the Hindu population, and were migrants from the ‘Punjab Proper’.25 Their major castes were Mirhotras, Khannas and Kapur. Only major Hindu caste of indigenous origin were Aroras, forming an over-whelming majority of the Hindu population in the city. Locally they were not termed as Hindus, but were called ‘Karar’. They had a monopoly over the professions of trade and money-lending. Therefore, they had a vast land occupied on mortgage in the district. They maintained their own system of ‘goot’ (sub-caste) within the Arora community. Therefore, they had naturally a distance with other population of the city as well as grievances and whenever there was a communal tension, this section had to face the grievances of the other sections of the society.26 Other than these major Hindu tribes, there were tribes of indigenous Indian origin the part of whose had mixed communal following. The people from those castes could be found among the followers of Islam as well as Hindus and Sikhs. Common among them were; Faqirs who had almost equal number of followers of Islam and Hinduism. The same was the case with Ahirs, Jats, Rajputs and Bhattis.

On the contrary, major Muslim castes were universally Muslims and had migrated from Central Asia, Middle East, Persia and Afghanistan. Although the contacts between Multan and these regions were established since long, the process had a dynamic impact through the politics of invasions. The arrival of the Syeds and Qureshis has continued since the second century of Hijra through the regions of Central Asia and Persia and through the sea routs, especially since Muhammad bin Qasim’s invasion of Sind. Other Central Asian and Persian flocks continued to enter in the region and partially settle down in Multan region during the long age of Muslim invasions from Mahmud of Ghazna in the tenth century to Ahmed Shah Abdali in the Eighteenth century. This period created an environment for the settlement of Mughals, Iranians, Kurds, Medes and Afghans in the Multan city and they are still residing in the city mostly known through their sub-clans or castes.27

4.2. Religious-Professional Demographic Taxonomy of Multan

The case with the professional groups which in Hindu system of social stratification were considered ‘Kummy’ [the working class] and were treated as ‘low castes’, was very different. Divided into a system of castes on Hindu pattern, like guilds of European Middle ages and having a strict system for maintaining purity of professional blood, with the exception of a few communally mixed professions, almost all professional groups and castes were overwhelmingly followers of Islam. As Multan was a city known for the cotton products therefore in spite of the existence of all major professions of civilized society, most of the professionals were working in the professions which were related to the products of cotton. Two types of professions were perfectly occupied by the Muslims: the professions related to the Cotton industry and professions related to cleansing of human environment. The following table reflects the communal nature of professional castes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Castes</th>
<th>% of Muslims</th>
<th>% of Non-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

53
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Muslims</th>
<th>Hindus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Banjara</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bharai</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macchi</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nangan</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qasab</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kutana/Mussali</td>
<td>99.9%</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mirasi</td>
<td>99.8%</td>
<td>0.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malah</td>
<td>99.76%</td>
<td>0.24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kumhar</td>
<td>99.6%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mochi</td>
<td>99.0%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nai</td>
<td>99.0%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teli</td>
<td>99.0%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarkhan</td>
<td>98.9%</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julah</td>
<td>98.5%</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darzi</td>
<td>97.8%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penja</td>
<td>97.6%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chimba</td>
<td>97.5%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanchan</td>
<td>97.5%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lohar</td>
<td>97.4%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dhobi</td>
<td>97.08%</td>
<td>2.92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kahar</td>
<td>95.6%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faqir</td>
<td>95.0%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nat</td>
<td>92.0%</td>
<td>8.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>90.0%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kamboh</td>
<td>85.6%</td>
<td>14.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunar</td>
<td>67.0%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahatam</td>
<td>63.5%</td>
<td>36.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jogi and Rewal</td>
<td>55.6%</td>
<td>44.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bazigar</td>
<td>46.0%</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jhiwar</td>
<td>38.5%</td>
<td>61.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chuhra</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>75.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lodha</td>
<td>18.8%</td>
<td>81.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labana</td>
<td>10.0%</td>
<td>90.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kori</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>97.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marija</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chimar</td>
<td>0.55 %</td>
<td>99 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mazhabi</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table shows a communal divide in the professional arena very strong. Most of the professions either minor or major were held by the Muslims, However, some of the professions mentioned at the end of the table were dominated by the Hindus. This division reflects, in one way or other, the religious belief system also. For example Mazhabi can be considered a free religion and no Muslim claimed to be
Religious Locale and Inter-Religions Demographic Structure of Colonial Multan

a Mazhabi. However, among the Hindus this trend was dominated. In the same way, professions working with the leather products were dominated by the Muslims as Hindus were considered to be against the use of meat. The analysis of the other professions can produce a more better understanding of the demographic structure of the region.

Conclusion:

Multan appear to be a multi-cultural and multi-ethnic religious and commercial centre since ancient times, linked with the Persia, Central Asia, Middle East, Hindostan and Bengal through land routs as well as water channels. Its ethnic compound seems to have developed ‘Multani Culture’ well known for its ability to absorb differing and conflicting cultural traits as well tolerance as three fundamental parameters of demographic analysis, i.e., Race, religion and profession seem to be working together in the city, as ethnic identity was closely linked with the communal identity. Simultaneously, the professional or vocational identity was associated with the communal-religious symbols and forms of representations. The cast structure appear to be working equal to the level of medieval guild structure of Europe, especially those of working classes or professional classes independent of feudal structure. The professional classes’ strong sense of superiority and pride did not allow the practitioners of other professions to enter in their family circles in spite of a strong communal brotherhood. They were used to marry among the families members of who belonged to their professional groups. They have their particular customs and rituals mostly related to their professions. They had a group of people assigned the task of maintaining communication with all the members of the guild in the region; for example ‘Mochi Mang’ or ‘Jat Bhagat’ (A group who was accustomed to beg only from the people who were attached with a particular profession and were used to serve as mediators between the members of the guild). The existence of such groups was very common to serve the purpose of communication between the members of guild. They were highly respected as they had contacts with the hierarchy of the guild from top to bottom and were used to serve the purpose of development of new matrimonial alliances. However, this guild interest was dominated by the communal identity during the first half of twentieth century. This structure seems to be broken due to the mass scale migration after the independence to India and Pakistan. The city became a single community centre of Muslim mercantile class as well as professional except a very few Hindus and Christians. The loss of multi-communal still did not affect the Multi-ethnic and multi-cultural status of the city. It still holds this tradition with pride.

References:

1 In the recent years, a number of initiatives have been taken to restore the antiquarian status of Multan city. Other than placing a number of monuments on the list of world heritage by UNESCO, the city is declared sister city with Rome of Italy and Damascus of Syria. The Government of Italy has signed a memorandum of
understanding with the city government of Multan for the restoration of old city of Multan especially, the Old City Wall.


3 See Dr. Khurram Qadir’s ‘How I Became a Saraiki’ in *Saraiki Wasaib*, Multan. Saraiki Area Study Centre, 2010.


5 Ashiq Muhammad Khan, ‘Multan Through the Ages’, in *Saraiki Wasaib*, op. cit., pp. 1-26


8 See any Satellite Map of Multan on internet.


10 I am not going to take up this issue in detail as it is discussed in detail by Dr. Humaira Arif in his article ‘Medieval Period and the commercial Trends of Multan’ in *Saraiki Wasaib*, op. cit., pp. 123-134.

11 These names are taken from different Ancient and medieval sources. However a number of modern historians have used references of those sources, especially Indian, Greek, Persian and Arab sources. See for details Ashiq Muhammad Khan Durrani, *Multan Through the Ages* and Humaira Arif Dasti, *Multan: A Province of the Mughal Empire*, Karachi: Royal Book Company, 1998.

12 See Ahsan Wagha, ‘Saraiki Area: the Centre and the circle’ in *Saraiki Wasaib*, pp. 111-122.


14 For the detail of these routs other than travelogues see *An Atlas of the Mughal Empire*, Delhi, 1982.


16 The stories of Ram, Lakshman and Sita, three popular mythological Deities well venerated among the followers of indigenous Indian religions are also attached with this region. One popular story narrates:
'The River Ravi flows down a distance of nine miles in a straight canal in this region. According to local Hindu mythology of the time, this position of River Ravi was ascribed to the miracle of Ram and Lakshman. According to local Hindu mythology, one day Ram and Lakshman were taking bath in the Ravi and there was no one to watch there clothes. While swimming they desired the river to flow straight so that they could watch their clothes. They swim about nine miles and the river began to change its course and became straight according to the wishes of Ram and Lakshman. Another story relates that Ram was watching Sita who was sitting on the bank of River Ravi (at Sita Kund) and was washing her clothes. Ram wanted to watch her beauty and the river respected his wish. After swimming nine miles they came out from the river: Ram on the Left bank and Lakshman on the right bank. Two sacred places began to be known as Ram Choutra and Lukshman Choutra and were well venerated among the Hindus of the region. Temples were erected on the spots and an annual fair was used to held on these places in the month of Besakh (April). Dewan Sawan Mal of Multan not only rebuilt the temple of Ram Choutra but also erected a temple in Sara-i-Sidho which is still being used as a school.’ (Lal Chand, *Geography Zila Multan*, (Multan: Lal Chand Publishers, n.d.), p.18; Lala Fateh Chand, *Multan Kay Zila Ka Geographia*, (Lahore: Mufeed-e-Aam, 1888), pp. 44-5.

17 Suraj Kund is a term applied to the place of worship of Sun-god. It still reminds the dominant impact this deity in and around Multan as the place is still known with the same name.


19 The Sufi tradition in Multan is constructed around the person of Bahauddin Zakariya, Shah Rukn e Alam, Shah Shams Sabzwari, Musa Pak Shaheed and Shah Yousuf Gardez. The mausoleums of the saints are the centers of Sufi practices even today.

20 The Data of earlier period is not available, therefore, the table is derived from the data available in *Punjab District Gazetteers, Volume XXVII. Part B. Multan District Statistical Tables* (Lahore: Superintendent Government Printing, 1936), p. xxxiii.


22 Gazetteer of Multan District 1923, p. 118


24 See *The Gazetteer of Multan 1923*.

25 The term ‘Punjab Proper’ is used in the District Gazetteer Multan 1923 for the areas dominated by the Sikhs and origin of Sikh Empire.
The term ‘Karar’ is still used in the rural areas of Multan for the community of Hindu money lenders. However, in general it is used for all classes of Hindus in Multan.

See for detail the ethnic data provided by Aulad Ali Gillani in his *Muraqa-i-Multan*, Lahore: 1996


The tradition has been functional by the end of twentieth century. However with the growth of globalization and spread of modern mechanical profession, the tradition has gone declined. See for details Lochan Singh Buxi, Bhakti Movement: Its Impact on Sikh Spiritual Tradition, *Studies in Sikhism and Comparative Religions*, 17(1), 1998. pp 107-28. The Same tradition among the Hindu division of professions is associated with Mochi Mang.
THE IDENTITY CRISIS IN MUSLIM STATE OF PAKISTAN: A HISTORIAL ANALYSIS AND FUTURE PROSPECTS

Abstract

The aim of this research paper is to revisit the establishment of Pakistan in 1947. Primary sources based on historical documents are used as evidence that how and why the then political elites of different provinces (included in Pakistan) were hesitant and unwilling to form a single Muslim state. Jinnah’s vision about united India and in case of partition about Muslim state has also been discussed in the light of the British and Indian documents. For securing a peaceful, stable and sustainable Pakistan it is suggested that the identity of the state be revisited in the light of the ground realities which requires a lot of serious deliberation contemplation, wisdom and expertise.

KEYWORDS: Pakistan, Partition, Cripps Mission, Cabinet Mission, Bengal, Punjab, Baluchistan, NWFP, Jinnah, Viceroy, Referendum.

INTRODUCTION:

In 1950s the Social Sciences Research Council (SSRC) at Chicago University constituted a committee to look into the issues of comparative politics. The committee reported that while involved in the Processes of Nation and State Building every state has to face the crises of Identity, Legitimacy, Democracy, Participation, Distribution and penetration. These crises do not confront on some particular time nor they can be resolved once for all; rather they perpetuate and while being resolved keep confronting the elites in one way or the other who have to cope with them all the time.

The aim of the present study is to investigate into the ever aggravating crisis of Identity in Pakistan in its past, present and future perspectives. These crises facing every state are closely related to the twin processes of nation and state building. If the elites are wise and have vision, they achieve the target of state building through the process of nation building because if they endeavour to achieve the target of state building at the cost of nation building, neither of these targets could possibly be achieved and the crisis of Identity becomes more and more difficult to be coped with and resolved consequently posing an immense danger to the very survival of the state itself. The political elite in Pakistan, since 1947, have ignored this crisis either due to lack of wisdom or attention, thus adding to the Complexity of the Identity crisis.
Emergence of Bangladesh in 1971 and aggravated crisis of penetration in Baluchistan on part of the Pakistani state right in 2013 are self explanatory examples. For proper conception and understanding of the crisis of identity in Pakistan, it is pertinent that we refer to the respective Identity of the various provinces and areas, during the British Raj, which ultimately constituted Pakistan in 1947. Moreover over the Identity of the Pakistani State as conceived by Jinnah the founder of Pakistan shall also be analyzed. First of all we will discuss the pre Partition situation in these provinces and areas.

PUNJAB:

During the freedom movement in India, the Punjab was kept aloof from all India politics and committed to its peculiar non-communal alliance among Muslims, Hindus and Sikhs. Sir Fazl-i-Hussain, the leader of the unionist party of the Punjab wrote to sir Sikander “I have also asked Ahmad Yar (Daultana’s Father) to strongly press on him (Jinnah) the advisability of keeping his finger out of the Punjab pie” (1)

Though Fazl-i-Hussain died before the 1937 elections in India, the unionist premiers of the Punjab continued resisting Jinnah’s interference in the Punjab and stood for provincial autonomy till the end of their rule in the province. It is worth mentioning that for penetration of the All India Muslim league in Punjab Jinnah had to sign a pact known as Jinnah Sikander pact which allowed the Muslim members of the unionist party to obtain dual membership of the All India Muslim league. Moreover it is on record that in 1942 Punjab was the first province which sought separate dominion status “In Summer 1942 Sikander, the Sikh leader Baldev Singh and the Hindu Chhotu Ram concerted a plan to petition His Majesty’s government for virtually a separate dominion of the Punjab, but in the circumstances of Quit India, it evoked no response from the government” (2) though this attempt was not successful, the Punjab leadership continued to stand for a united Punjab and provincial autonomy for the province till 1947. The unionist party was so committed to the unity of the Punjab that when in 1946 election the party could win only 10 Muslims seats out of 79, they still keeping in view the majority of the Muslims in the province, elected Sir Khizar Hayat as their premier. In 1946 Sir Khizar while meeting the Cabinet Mission and viceroy Wavell emphasized that Punjab should not be partitioned and apposed its union with Sindh, NWFP (at present KPK) and Baluchistan.(3) Iftikhar Hussain Mamdot, the president of the Punjab Muslim League told the mission that he stood for a united and undivided Punjab. (4) Where as another Muslim leaguer from Punjab sir Feroz Khan Noon told the Governor that he did not believe in Jinnah’s Pakistan but could not appose the idea for some reasons.(5)

BENGAL:

Bengal had made an attempt to attain independence outside India and Pakistan as early as in 1946 when Sir Nazim ud Din the then Chief Minister of Bengal discussed about the separate dominion status for Bengal with the governor (6). In 1946 Abul Hashim a Muslim leaguer from Bengal raised the demand for a separate Bengali state in the council session of the All India Muslim league on the ground that the Lahore resolution provided for two separate states. (7) Again in May
1947 Hussain Suhrawardy the premier of Bengal joined by Sarat Chandra Bose attempted to attain a separate united Bengal and secured the blessing of Gandhi for it.

“Gandhi increasingly preoccupied with communal problems in Eastern India was the only National Congress leader to favour the scheme to which Jinnah was attracted” (8) However Nehru and Patel never agreed to such proposal. As far as Jinnah was concerned he was out and out in support of the united Bengal. During an interview with Jinnah, Mountbatten recorded” I asked Mr. Jinnah strait-out what his views were about keeping Bengal united at the price of its remaining out of Pakistan. He said without any hesitation “I should be delighted. What is the use of Bengal without Calcutta, they had much better remain united and independent. I am sure they will be on friendly terms with us” (9)

In spite of the fact that the congress High Command did not support the move from the very beginning, Sarat Bose and Kiran Shankar Roy (Bengal Congress) continued their lone efforts to reach some agreement with the Muslim leaders. The final agreement was reached in a conference on 20 May 1947 at Sarat Bose’s house. It was attended by Suhrawardy, Fazlul Rehman, Muhammad Ali, Abul Hashim and Malik on behalf on the Muslim league. The other side was represented by Sarat Bose, Kiran Shankar Roy and Satya Ranjan Bakshi. The conference agreed that the new state would he named as “Free State of Bengal” there was also an agreement on the basic and key features of the future constitution (10) including that in the new state the chief Minister would be a Muslim while the Minister for internal affairs would be Hindu. Moreover Muslim and Hindus would have equal share in services i-e military and police. The governor of Bengal was so much optimistic that he suggested to the British cabinet through the Viceroy and the Secretary of State for India that they must keep a provision for a third dominion i.e. Bengal while sorting out any plan for India’s independence. It is worth mentioning that all the papers prepared for the cabinet meeting in the last week of May 1947 did contain a provision for three dominions (11). During this development Nehru issued a statement that the congress could agree to the proposal of a united Bengal only if it remained within the Indian union (12). This condition was acceptable neither to the All India Muslim league leadership nor to the Bengali Muslims who were not in favour of joining a Hindu dominated union, nevertheless did not prefer to join the Muslims of North Western India too. Under these circumstances the All India and Bengal Muslim leagues denounced any efforts made for a united Bengal. Mountbatten who was in London and watching the situation with care could hardly reach any other decision than he did. He informed the members of the cabinet in its meeting held on 28 May 1947 that he had abandoned all his hopes for a united independent Bengal. (13) The British Government was not prepared to give independent and sovereign status to Eastern Bengal alone; hence after being refused a united Bengal outside Pakistan and Hindustan, the Bengali Muslims had two options either to join Pakistan along with the north western provinces or to join the Indian union as part of the united Bengal. They feared the latter more than the former hence chose to join Pakistan albeit with some reservations that their culture,
economy, language and social traditions were distinct from that of the western counter parts. Even as pro-Pakistan leader as Nazim-ud-Din did not have any misgivings about it when he issued a statement to the effect that the establishment of an independent sovereign Bengal was the ultimate aim of Bengali Muslims. It is important to note here that even after the partition of India, Suhrawardy stayed back in Calcutta still negotiating with the Hindu leaders about the possibility of an independent united Bengal (14)

NORTH WESTERN FRONTIER PROVINCE (NOW KPK)

The North Western Frontier Province (NWFP) also had an unsuccessful attempt to achieve a separate state for the Pathans. The province was in fact in a very peculiar condition at the time of partition in 1947. The province had an overwhelming Muslim majority of 93% with a congress ministry in office since 1937 with an interval when it resigned as a taken of non-cooperation in the war effort. The congress ministry opposed the partition of India while the All India Muslim League demanded the inclusion of the province in Pakistan which was one of the Muslim majority areas of the sub-continent. Out of 50 members of the provincial legislature 33 belonged to congress. Khan Abdul Qayyum Khan who was later on appointed as chief minister of the province was deputy leader of the Congress before the partition. Dr. Khan Sahib the congress chief minister told the Cabinet Mission bluntly that the Pattans had no love for their Punjabi neighbors and were not willing to join Pakistani, what they wanted most of all was to be entirely independent. (15)

This province joined Pakistan in quite a different manner than THE other provinces of the British India where the legislative assemblies voted to join Pakistan or India. In this province a referendum was held to decide whether the people would join Pakistan or India. Abdul Ghaffar Khan and Dr. Khan Sahib who was the chief minister of the province opposed the idea of referendum on the issue of joining Pakistan or Hindustan. They demanded that if a referendum was to be held it should be held giving the choice of joining Pakistan or forming an independent state of Pathanistan. (16)

At this juncture the congress leaders could not come to their rescue because Nehru had vehemently opposed the move for an independent untitled Bengal. Nehru “felt the other edge of the dual dominion, its two nations side in the following week when he pleaded in vain for his Majesty’s Government statement of policy to offer the option of independence to the NWFP” (17). If Bengal had been given the right to choose independent status by the congress, the people of the NWFP could be given the choice of independent Pathanistan and there were ample chances that they would have voted for an independent Pathanistan. (18) In these circumstance the Congress and the Khudai Khidmatgars boycotted the referendum hence there was a very little turnout.

BALUCHISTAN AND KALAT STATE:

Baluchistan was not a governor province under the British Government in India and was divided into different territories i-e states, tribal areas and a chief
**THE IDENTITY CRISIS IN MUSLIM STATE OF PAKISTAN: A HISTORICAL ANALYSIS AND FUTURE PROSPECTS**

... commissioner’s province which consisted of the areas taken on lease by the British Government from the Khans of Kalat under driftnet treaties from time to time (19). The Khan of Kalat claimed that Kalat was not an Indian state and was never a part of India. He claimed a status equal to that of Nepal as he had direct treaty relations with white hall and had no dealings with the government of India (20). Moreover the British Government in India did not consider Baluchistan as part of the Indian subcontinent (21) Khan’s claim appears to be well based because when the independence of India was announced by the British Government, it was Jinnah himself who not only advised the Khan to claim back his territories which formed British Baluchistan but as a constitutional expert pleaded his case as well. (22) Though the British did not return the territory claimed by the khan, yet the viceroy secured an agreement between Kalat and (would be) Pakistan in August 1947. By virtue of this agreement Pakistan recognized the independent and sovereign status of Kalat. (23) In fact, by virtue of this agreement Kalat had ceded to Pakistan and Pakistan had inherited all the obligations and rights, the British government had towards Kalat. The khan was keen to retain his internal independence. (24) and his aspirations could be satisfied if his state could form a part of Pakistan’s federation with maximum autonomy for the units.

As far as the tribal areas of Baluchistan were concerned, they had already expressed their choice in 1946 when the Tumandars of Marri and Bugti tribes sent a memorandum to the British government demanding that under any future constitutional arrangement in India, their tribal regions be included in a federation with Kalat. They further requested that their region be separated from the areas of the Punjab. (25) But in 1947 they were not allowed to join Kalat and were rather asked to choose between Pakistan and India.

The agent to the Governor General called a meeting of the Shahi Jirga and the Quetta municipality to put the scheme of partition before them which was to voted after a couple of days. In that meeting, Sardar Jafar Khan Jamali and sardar Dost Muhammad Mengal expressed that they would go with Kalat. Marri and Bugti tribes had already desired a federation with Kalat while retaining their independent status. It is believed that at the said juncture there was an attempt to achieve an independent Baluchistan but Khan himself was not involved in any such effort. (26)

The agent to the Governor General assessed the satiation and declared that there would be an immediate voting and that there would be no choice of Kalat etc. The members had to vote for Pakistan and India only. They voted for Pakistan under the impression that the Bluches would have their own government according to their political, social and economic conditions. (27)

**SINDH:**

Sindh was the province which as early as in 1943 demanded through its legislature that the Muslims of India be given the right to form their own national states. The resolution read. “The Muslim as a single separate nation be entitled to the
right to have independent national states of their own carved in the zones where they are in majority in the subcontinent.” (28)

This resolution suggests that the Sindh legislature stood for self-government in Sindh and for every other nationality among the Muslims of India. Again in 1946 the chief minister of Sind, Ghulam Hussain Hidayatullah told the Cabinet Mission that all would be well if only all India politics could be kept out of the provinces and in particular out of Sindh. He further emphasized that Sindh must be left alone by all outsiders whatever their faith was (29) G.M. Syed another Sindhi and a former worker of the All India Muslim League stood for Azad (free) Sindh, not Pakistan. (30)

BAHAWALPUR STATE:

Bahawalpur was a state bordering Sindh and Punjab. It had resisted an occupation by the Punjab in the 19th century with the help and guarantee of the British Government and the ruler had shown loyalty to the king emperor through this period. On 14 August 1947 the Amir of Bahawalpur declared his independence and sovereignty over his territory after the end of the British paramountcy. He declared that;

“In view of the geographical position of my state and its cultural and economic affinities with the Pakistan dominion, my representatives should participate in the labors and deliberations of the Pakistan Constituent Assembly which will enable the two states to arrive at a satisfactory constitutional arrangement with regard to certain important matters of common concern” (31)

This statement suggests that the Amir desired for internal autonomy and independence with in the larger former work of Pakistan. later on in October 1947 an instrument of agreement signed by Jinnah and the Amir was secured through the good offices of Syed Amjad Ali (a friend of the state’s chief minister) and Bahawalpur acceded to Pakistan. This agreement guaranteed the internal autonomy of the state and some rights and privileges of the successors of the Amir (32)

DISCUSSION:

Now it is pertinent to analyze Jinnah’s point of view about the identity of the new state. From 1920s to the end he consistently advocated for the safeguards and guarantees of the political, economic social and religious rights of the Muslims with in a political and constitutional arrangement. In fact his fore most and ultimate preference was his fourteen points formula presented in 1929. He always kept opened all the doors to achieve this aim. The history provides evidence that Jinnah welcomed each and every proposal which provided safeguards for the rights of the Indian Muslims. The Lahore Resolution demanded establishment of independent and sovereign states in the Muslim majority areas of the sub-continent, nevertheless during 1940-1947 Jinnah welcomed every proposal providing safeguards and guarantees of the rights of the Muslims with in a united India. When in 1942 Cripps Mission visited India, Jinnah was inclined to agree to any proposal which could guarantee the safeguards for the political economic, social, cultural and religious
rights of the Muslims. In fact Jinnah did not prefer that the provinces of the Punjab and Bengal having a little more than 50% majority of the Muslims should be divided on Hindu Muslim basis. He believed that if partitioned their basic infrastructure would be destroyed. For this reason, when in 1946 Cabinet Mission visited India, Jinnah accepted the Mission’s proposal regarding the federation of the united India albeit with his own interpretations which were confirmed and seconded by the members of the mission. But when Nehru interpreted the proposal in his peculiar manner which could feasibly violate the rights of the Muslims, Jinnah rejected the said proposals.

In the beginning of 1947, when the independence was forth coming Jinnah emphasized that the Punjab and Bengal Should not be partitioned. Jinnah supported the move for a united Bengal and establishment of an independent and sovereign state of Bengal outside India and Pakistan which has been discussed in detail earlier. Although Jinnah opposed the partition of the Punjab but there is no evidence that he ever supported an independent and sovereign Punjab.

Now we discuss the British Government views about the future of the sub continent. The views of the British cabinet and the select committee on India were represented by L.S. Amery, the secretary of state for India. In 1945 he wrote to the viceroy.

“The conclusion which I have drawn from (political and constitutional problems of India) and which in deed was also the conclusion of the Simon commission and in effect, so far as the British India is concerned, of the joint select committee, is that India cannot have majority controlled executive at the centre, for that would at once involve Pakistan and no doubt within Pakistan further secession”. (33) Sir Edward Penderal moon who had served in the Indian civil service was even more clear about the demands of local self rule by the people of different regions when in 1945 he wrote “An India united other wise than by consent is an India divided ab initio” (34)

As far as the Eastern Bengal was concerned, the British Government neither preferred to grant independent and sovereign status to the province, (35) nor they considered its joining Pakistan as a freezable and viable solution (36)

In the light of the documentary evidence, it can be safely concluded that Jinnah neither preferred the partition of India nor the establishment of one or more Muslim states, he rather made many attempts to escape this partition till the end of the day. Secondly he never conceived an orthodox Islamic state. Establishment of separate Muslim state or states was his second option, where the political, economic, social and religious rights of the Muslims could be safeguarded, hence it is significant to devise a distinction between a Muslim majority state and an Islamic state. It is well proved from Jinnah’s speech in the Constituent Assembly on 11th of August 1947 that Pakistan’s identity was that of a Muslim majority state and not an Islamic state. In this speech he declared that state would have no concern with any religion which view was further strengthened when he appointed sir Jugandar Nath
Mandal (a Hindu) as the first Law Minister of Pakistan. It goes without saying that in an Islamic state a Hindu could not hold that portfolio. It is worth noting that Jinnah in his presidential address at the 27th annual session of the All India Muslims league held on 4 April 1942 declared “It must be realized that India was never a country or a nation India’s problem is international in this subcontinent and differences, cultural, social, political and economic are so fundamental that they cannot be covered up, concealed or confused but must be handled by all as realists. (37) It proves that Jinnah was very well aware of the complexity of the India’s and afterwards Pakistan’s political problems.

CONCLUSION:
The preceding discussion and supportive documents suggest that Pakistan as established in 1947 was neither the preference of Jinnah nor of the political elite belonging to the various constituent units of the country. It was rather a plan imposed by the colonial and neo colonial powers for the fulfillment of their future strategic designs as was proved later in 1979 when Pakistan was dragged into Afghan war which situation continues in 2013 making the country suffer from huge and irreparable losses.

Emergence of Bangladesh in 1971 reflects this acute crisis of identity which was very much present even before 1947. The rest of Pakistan is not immuned too and the said crisis is ever aggravating by the passage of time.

The aim of this study is not to suggest by any means that Pakistan as a state cannot be sustained. What is pertinent that keeping in view the ground realities, the identity issue must be revisited and re-determined which would be possible only after recognizing the regional and local identities of the provinces and within these provinces identities of various nationalities. If the European states which had been at war with each other could form a union, there is no reason that various provinces of Pakistan could not do the same. It appears that the concept of “New social contract” presented by late Benazir Bhutto the former Prime Minister of Pakistan indicated towards the conclusion drawn by this study. Over the period the gulf has widened but the problems can always be solved provided that the political, Judicial and military leadership should make efforts to minimize the said crisis instead of maximizing it through their unwise moves and policies. For instance the Punjabi elite who is in Power in the Punjab and Islamabad must deal the other provincial governments with utmost care because the situation is very much fragile. The areas which were not willing to become a part of Pakistan could be peacefully put together only by an open vision and utmost wisdom.

It is pertinent that the dynamics behind the establishment of Pakistan be re-understood and the political, social and economic preferences of various nationalities be brought within a cosmopolitan frame work and infrastructure. It is a difficult test for Pakistan’s political Judicial and military leadership.

To conclude “unless philosophers are the kings or kings are the philosophers the states shall never rest from evil”
Plato (The Republic)
REFERENCES:

4. See Nawab Mamdot's Meeting with the cabinet mission and Wavell. 2 April 1946 Ibid Doc. 41, P-90.
8. R.J Moore Op-cit P-285
11. See meeting of the cabinet and India and Burma Committee 21 May 1947. in Nicholas Monsergh (ed) op-cit V.X Document 553.
18. See Fayyaz Ahmad Hussain op-cit his Interview with sir Edward Penderal Moon, London May 1983 P-68.
20. Ibid
22. Mir Ahmad Yar Khan op-cit P 147.
24. Mir Amad Yar Khan opcit
25. Ibid P.143
27. Quoted from Fayyaz Ahmad Hussain Op-cit P-69.
32. This agreement is available with the National Documentation cell cabinet division Islamabad.
34. See letter from Amery to wavell dated 24 June 1945, India office Library No. L/PO/10/22.
35. Penderal Moon " The Pakistan's Nettle" a paper written in 1945 quoted from Fayyaz Ahmad Hussain op-cit P.16.
36. See Nicholas Mansergh op-cit Vol X Doc. 553
37. Ibid Vol X Doc. 264.
38. Extract from Jinnah's Presidential address at the 27th Annual session of the All India Muslim leage Allahabod 4 April 1942 in Jamil uddin Ahmad (ed) op-cit P-424.
Does Religious Capital Transmit Across the Generations? A Gender Based Evidence From Multan District

*Fareed Shareef  
**Imran Sharif Chaudhry  
***Toseef Azid

Abstract
From the foregoing it will manifestly follow that parental religiosity greatly determines the religiosity of the offspring. In respect of males, the study found that age is an important and active factor in determining their religious orientation and for females, the same has not been observed. However, in the case of females what has put finally that area of residence has nothing to do with their religiosity but the same is an important factor for males. The study establishes that urban males are less religious than rural ones owing to the opportunity cost of their time allocation. Education has been found to be an insignificant though positive factor in the case of both males and females. Considering the observance of religious values at home by the parents and its impact on offspring, we find that both for male and female it has importance, while for extended females model there is no significant impact. The findings of this study show that parental authoritarianism for controlling non-religious activities of their offspring is far more pronounced in the case of females than in the case of males. An important conclusion from this research work is that the parental religious characteristics are certainly transmitted to the offspring irrespective of the gender.

Key Words: Intergenerational Transmission, Religious Capital, Parental Harmony, child attachment, Gender

1.1 Introduction:
Economics of religion is an emerging area of research. It has gained currency among the social scientists who value religion as the resource for producing religious goods. With the improvement in the data collecting methods and econometric techniques now the religious behaviors can better be explained in numerical terms. The pure economic concepts of rational choice theory and optimization are therefore applied to religious behaviors to trace how religion can influence economic decision making and determine the religious orientation of the next generation. Parents serve as the reservoir from where children take supply of their religious goods. This study is an attempt to explore how intergenerational transmission of religious capital can influence the economic decision making of the children by making a gender analysis.
We have used a sample of 613 households collected from district Multan regarding the Islamic religious practices and multiple regression models were used for analysis. The rest of the paper is organized in such a way that the first section 1.2 contains definitions and related concepts of religious capital. The review of the literature has been discussed in section 1.3 in. The sources of data and methodology have been elaborated in section 1.4 of this study. The discussion of the results and findings of the study have been expressed in section 1.5 and finally, the conclusion is given in section 1.6.

1.2 Definitions and Concept:
There have been several different definitions of spiritual/religious capital. Iannaccone (1990) defines spiritual capital as:

“Skills and experiences specific to one’s religion, including religious knowledge, familiarity with church ritual and doctrine, and friendships with fellow worshipers”

Stark and Finke (2000) using Iannacone’s definition of spiritual capital have defined religious capital as:

“Religious capital consists of the degree of mastery of an attachment to a particular religious culture hence in making religious choices people will attempt to conserve their religious capital”.

Stark and Finke (2000) established that in making religious choices, people attempt to conserve their religious capital. They removed the issues of friendship, and added the need to hold onto one’s religious capital, which is a key to a lot of studies that have been done on denomination switching.

1.3 Review of Assorted Studies:
The successful transmission of religious beliefs and values from one generation to the next are a prerequisite for the cultural continuity and vitality of a religion. The mechanism of transmission may take different forms and is affected by different factors. For example the source of religious inspiration for child is very important i.e. parents, peer group or close relatives who can greatly determine the pace and efficiency of this transmission.

Religious Transmission: A Theoretical Perspective
Literature generally provides four theoretical approaches for the study of religious transmission namely social learning theory, the developmental theory, cultural broadening theory, and, a rational choice theory.

Bandura (1977) developed social learning theory. According to this approach children learn by continuous observation of attitudes and behaviors of their role models particularly their parents. Hence parents characteristics being central to this model may greatly affect i.e. impede or fasten the mechanism of this transmission. This approach refuse cognitive ability hypothesis in the acquisition of religion in children life and give greater weight to parent’s role.

The developmental approach, along with parents influence, incorporates importance of different events and experiences in the acquisition of religious beliefs during different phases of the life cycle of children. With age children try to develop
Does Religious Capital Transmit Across the Generations? A Gender Based Evidence From Multan District

their unique identity, different from parents, and their religiosity tends to decline but when they enter into the age of their parents after marriage and having kids they revert back to the religious ideology of their parents and try to instill same in their kids (Glass et al. 1986).

Cultural broadening theory popularized by Wuthnow (1991) and Hoge et al. (1993) suggests generational change resulting from liberalization of religiosity when children are exposed to alternative lifestyles and culture in educational institutions with their peer groups. Children regard the religious views of their parents as orthodox and feel liberty to adopt new ones with increasing level of education.

The rational choice theory gained popularity after the demise of secularization theory in America. According to this theory the consumer of religion tries to maximize rewards and minimize cost of religious activities i.e. group affiliations and opportunity cost of religious participation. This theory regards consumer (children) as logical actors sidelines the emotional human element of religiosity as proposed in social learning theory.

Iannaccone (1990, 1991) used this theory at micro level to explain household religious production function. He regards religious satisfaction as output resulting from inputs of time and money in this production function. In this production process, “religious human capital” is also produced which is referred to as stock of knowledge, experience gained during this process. As a stock, this religious human capital can be used further as an input to reinforce the religious affiliations and produce religious goods.

This theory rests on the postulation that adults rates of religious participation will be strongly correlated with childhood religious participation and training [Iannaccone, 1990]. Like social learning theory this theory postulates continuity of religious thoughts across generations and the importance of family role in this process. However like developmental theory it incorporates age specific changes expected to vary utility of religion for an individual in different phases of life cycle.

Economic Modeling: An Empirical Analysis of Religious Capital

Extensive empirical research has been made on the religious capital in different sphere. However, it can broadly be categorized into gender model, demographic model, socioeconomic model and behavioral model. Most of these models are developed on the basis of hypothesis as follows.

1) Gender difference: Men, having higher opportunity cost of time, are expected to spare less time to religious activities than women

2) Schooling: in this regard two hypotheses are made. First explains negative impact of education on religiosity that is the secularization theory developed on the hypothesis that religiosity declines as the children climb up the ladder of education. The second hypothesis highlight positive impact of schooling from social capital aspect as ‘more educated people participate more in social networks including religious ones’.

71
3) Age: keeping opportunity cost of time spent on religious activities the hypothesis is formed as ‘initially with age increase religiosity declines and after certain level religiosity increases with age forming U shape pattern’.

4) Marital Status: the hypothesis is ‘conjugal harmony and spouse’s religiosity both are likely to be positively associated with ones religious activities and this correlation becomes strongest among the educated ones’.

5) Exposure to religious activities: children exposed to religious activities i.e. directly or indirectly through parent’s inspiration are likely to follow parent’s denominations.

Gender analysis in intergenerational context is widely made by researchers to give weight to the contribution of mother or father in the development of religious orientation of their children. Further this model is used to make a comparative analysis regarding religious devotedness between men and women i.e. time spent for religious activities. The empirical findings of the works [Acock & Bengtson, 1978; Hoge & Petrillo, 1978; Rosik & Gorsuch, 1985] suggest mothers to be more influential than fathers in fostering religious believe in their children. However, the works of [See Clark et al. 1988; Kieren & Munro, 1987; Luft & Sorell, 1986] assign more weight to father for religious molding of his children. Some group of researchers are of the view that both are important but function differently in shaping religious character of their child i.e. general religious activities influenced by mothers and specific as church attendance by fathers [Acock & Bengtson, 1978; Clark et al., 1988; Kieren & Munro, 1987; Rosik & Gorsuch, 1985].

Models related to socioeconomic outcomes of religion focus on schooling and educational attainments, parental religious harmony, parental matrimonial harmony and quality of parent child relationships. The studies [See Hoge & Petrillo, 1978; Ozorak, 1989; Hoge, Petrillo, & Smith, 1982] suggest that parents of same denominational membership have strong religious influence upon their children as compared to those having mixed religion. Regarding parent child relation and conjugal harmony between parents studies [See Luft & Sorell, 1986; Weigert & Thomas, 1972; Nelsen, 1981] find that conjugal agreement and tight family bond between parents and children has paramount effect on the transfer of parental religious believe to children. Religiosity and schooling correlation [See Lehrer, 2004; Altonji et al. 2005] show that high religiosity is positively associated with better school performances as religion creates positive externalities which help them perform better in schools.

The demographic model traces link of religion with fertility, mortality, health and its impact on the economic outcomes. The studies [See Hamilton et al., 2007; Adsera, 2006a; Hayford and Morgan, 2008] show that high level of religiosity is associated with high fertility. Regarding health correlations with religion and its economic outcomes [See Woodberry, 2006; Waite and Lehrer, 2003; Whitehead et al., 2001] suggest that high religiosity reduces risk of sexually transmitted diseases through aversion from extra matrimonial sex and relations. This produces positive impact on health and increases productivity and other labor market outcomes.
The behavioral models include study of age and time specific responses to religiosity and opportunity cost involved in the participation of religious activities. The foundational work was laid with the work of Azzi and Ehrenberg (1975) and Becker (1960, 1965) popularly known as ‘New Home Economics’ (NHE) approach. Later studies [See Long and Settle, 1977; Ehrenberg, 19770; Ulbrich and Wallace, 1983; Iannaccone, 1990, 1991] extended this approach in their works.

This model takes household production function to analyze maximization of religious utility with opportunity cost of time devoted for religious activities. Religiosity has U shape trend with age showing diminishing trends when opportunity cost of religious participation is high in youth and in later years religiosity tends to increase as opportunity cost of religious participation declines [Azzi and Ehrenberg, 1975]. Similarly people prefer to make monetary contribution rather physical participation in religion when high opportunity costs are involved in terms of economic benefits.

1.4 Data and Measures:
A random sample of 613 households for both males and females has been selected from chosen villages and towns of all Tehsil headquarters and sub-Tehsils of Multan district. In this study the residents of Tehsil headquarter are taken as urban residents and of sub-Tehsil or villages are defined as rural residents. The district census report of Multan showed that out of total population 42.2% is the resident of urban area with literacy percentage of 60.9 as compared to 57.8% of rural population with 29.5% literacy rate. In the sample the Muslims respondents of same sects with minimum age limit of 18 years have been taken so the study has focused on adults not on adolescents.

This study has used a multistage model of religiosity starting from a zero order regression model including only religious characteristics of both the parents and their children to the models with control variable (such as education, age, sex, marital status, area of residence etc.) and then mediating variables (variable relating to home environment) in the final model in order to take a complete picture of religiosity in intergenerational context. For each set of control and mediating variables the extended models are also estimated. We have made analysis of males and females respondents separately. For measuring religiosity this study has taken religious practices as proxy for religiosity. The dependent variables for child known as child religious Index (CRI) and independent variables for parents known as parental religious index (PRI) are a composite index of seven Islamic practices of which four are compulsory and three are optional. The first question regarding compulsory practice includes “How many times you offer prayers” with six options. As Namaz is offered five times a day in Islam so the values given were 1 to five time, 0.80 to four times, 0.60 to three times, 0.4 for two times, 0.2 for one times and 0 for not offering Namaz. The other three questions are “How often you pay Zakat” and “How many times you observed Hajj or Umrah” and “Do you observe fast”. All these three questions are recorded with three options i.e. for regularly (given value 1), off and on (given value 0.5) and never (given value 0). The remaining three
practices are optional and include questions as “How many times you recite Quran” and “How often you pay Alms and Sadaqat” and finally “How often you attend religious congregations/ceremonies (Naat/Discussion/Majalis)”. All these optional practices are also recorded with three options i.e. for regularly (given value 1), for off and on (given value 0.5) and never (given value 0). All of these seven responses were than transformed into a composite index whose value was ranging from 0 to 1.

The variables of home environment include child attachment variable (CATTACH), parental sharing of non-religious values (PNRVAL) and parental sharing of religious values (PRVAL). The child attachment variable was recorded with five questions each with dummy response of 1 for Yes and 0 otherwise. The questions were relating to the affection and intimacy between children and their parents such as “When you have grown up was your father/mother loving with you” and “Did you feel free to talk things over with your father/mother while growing up” and “Did you feel your father/mother were very close when you were above 20”. The variable of parental sharing of non-religious values include four questions such as “Do your parents allow you to watch music and movie channels” and “Do your parents tolerate to participate in functions where there is co-gathering”, “How often did you talk to your father/mother about your values &beliefs” and “Do your parents encourage you to participate in educational functions?”. All these questions were recorded with three options i.e. yes given value 1, sometimes given value 0.5 and No given value 0. Similarly on the same pattern parental sharing of religious values included questions as “How often your parents instruct you to observe Islamic religious practices”, “How often your father/mother compel you to observe veil (Pardah) when you go outside (for girls)”, “How often your father/mother compel you to say congregational prayers in mosque (for boys)”, “Do you have disagreement with your parents over certain religious issues?”.

Another important variable taken in the study is parental harmony (PHARM) which is important in transmission of religiosity across generations. This included five questions as “Do your mother and father belongs to the same creed”, “Do they support each other to attend religious ceremonies and congregations”, “Do they persuade each other to observe Islamic practices”, “Do they support each other financially for religious activities?” and “Do they have disagreement on any particular Islamic practice/issue”. All these are recorded in dummy responses 1 for yes and 0 otherwise. All of these variables are then transformed to composite index to give percentage effect of these behaviors.

**Results and Discussions**

**Transmission of Religiosity among Males:**

Using male’s data this study has adopted a multistage strategy (a three tier model) for the analysis of intergenerational transmission of religious capital among males. The results of the zero order regression show highly significant results confirming the hypothesis that parental religiosity greatly determines the religiosity of their children when no other variables are included in the model. The variable shows that for a one percent increase in the religiosity of the parents the child’s religiosity increases by 0.44 percents. When we add some control variables to judge
their impact on the child’s religiosity than many things come to the surface. In the model with control variables, the variable for area represents the location of the residence i.e. urban or rural. The variable is significant and appears with negative sign which means that the urban respondents are less religious than those from the rural areas. The interpretation of the sign is that the urban residents are 0.05 percents less religious as compared to their counterpart in the rural areas net of all the other factors.

In the un-extended model of control variable the child’s education is statistically significant and appears with positive sign which means that more educated children tend to be more religious. This means that for a one additional year of education the child’s religiosity increases by 0.008 percent. This positive association rests on the concept of social capital which explains positive network externalities of education i.e. a more educated person is likely to involve more in networks and organizations including religious ones.

The other control variable in the model is child’s age. Before explaining the result it is important to find the theoretical foundation of the association between age and religiosity in the literature. Three theories are used to explain the relationship between age and religiosity. The traditional theories find a sharp decline in religiosity till twenties and then from age of 30 to onward an increase in the trend of religiosity. The stability theory explains a negligible change in the religiosity with age and finally the disengagement theory propounds a declining religiosity with increasingly age. The results of these theories are based on heterogeneous factors hence have no consensus regarding the relationship between age and religiosity.

The result of our study is in line with the traditional theory which shows a positive association between age and religiosity after a specific age limit. The coefficient is statistically significant with value 0.002. However the relationship may be non linear depending upon the varying life course circumstances which Argue et al. (1999) has established as two peak phases of religious activity, adolescence and old age, with least religious activity during the age of 30 to 35. As our study is not a cohort based study due to limitations of data collection, we have just made an ordinary least square analysis to find the impact of age on religiosity of the respondents. These findings are in line with the findings of Campbell and Curtis (1994), Hout and Greeley (1987).

The extended model with control variables contains all the previous variables with one addition of the main variable i.e. parental religious behavior. When index of parental variable is included in the model the overall significance of the model improves from 6.8 percent to 26.4 percent which speaks volumes of the fact that parental religious characteristics have significant impact on the religiosity of the children. The coefficient of parental religiosity appears with the positive sign and is highly significant, with a value of 0.437. All the other variables in the extended model, except for child’s education, are significant with the same signs as the previous model. This means that for the children with the same age, living in same
area and with same parental religiosity, increasing the level of education has no influence on their religiosity.

In order to take a comprehensive view of the determinants of child’s religiosity, this study has also used mediating variable both with and without parental religious traits. The variable of parental harmony which is relating to the denominational harmony between parents appears to be insignificant with positive sign. It is established both theoretically and empirically that greater parental harmony has vital impact on the religious socialization of the child. The result with positive sign confirms the theory but in our model it is not affecting the religiosity of males. Similarly the variable of child attachment is depicting the association of parent-child relationship and it is generally assumed that high parent child attachment is core in the intergenerational transmission of religious traits from parents to child. The finding of our study is insignificant with positive sign. The overall significance of the model shown by the value of F-statistics is good however the R-squared value is very low.

The most important variable of home environment is parental provision of non-religious and liberal environment at home which, according to theory, should bear negative sign. The coefficient in our study appears with positive sign but it is not statistically significant. Out of all the explained variables the most important in explaining the association between home environment and child religiosity is the parental control and observance of religious practices of the children. The variable appears to be significant with positive sign depicting that for a one percent increase in the parents control for the observance of religious practices at home and outside the child’s religiosity increases by 0.164 percent. Similar findings are presented by Luft & Sorell, (1986) and Weigert & Thomas, (1972).

The extended model for males with mediating variables is again showing interesting results in the intergenerational transmission of religiosity. When parental religious practice variable is included in the model the variable of parental harmony turns out to be negative though remain insignificant. Only significant variable is religious practice observance by parents at home and own parental religious practice variables both with positive signs. The former shows that for one percent increase in the parental control for observance of religious control at home the religiosity of the child increases by 0.101 percent and for the later, a one percent increase in the parental religious practices the religiosity of the child increases by 0.424 percent.

Table 7.7 Religious Transmission: Partial Analysis for Male

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zero Order Regression</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Explanatory Variables</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F statistics = 88.65 (df) = 01 R² = 0.182 Adjusted R² = 0.180
Sample size N = 401

Model with Control Variables | Extended Model with Control Variables

76
### Transmission of Religious Capital Across the Generations: A Gender Based Evidence From Multan District

In order to analyze the factors that can impact the religiosity of females this study has used control and mediating variables, both with and without parental religious practice variable. The first model is zero order regression including only parental religious characteristics and its impact on the religiosity of the kids. The coefficient is highly important with positive sign showing that for a one percent increase in the religiosity of the parents the females’ religiosity increases by 0.42 percent. This means that parental religious characteristics are important predictor of the religiosity of the female respondents which confirms the hypothesis of our study that religiosity of those children is determined by the religiosity of their parents. The result of the zero order regression for females is almost similar to that of males’ sample.

When we come to the un-extended model of control variables to trace their impact on the religiosity of children, it is seen that none of the variables except intercept term is found significant however signs of the coefficient are appropriate. This means that for our sample data neither the age nor education and area of residence have any significant impact on the females’ religiosity. When the variable of parental religious characteristics is included in the model the overall significance of the model shown by F-statistics improves from 1.5 to 12.35 which confirm the fact that parental religious attitude is major contributing factor in the religiosity of the children. The coefficient of parent’s religious index is highly significant showing that for one percent increase in the religiosity of the parents the child’s religiosity increases by 0.425 percent. If we compare this model with that of the same model used for male data then we see that the area of residence and age of the males have

### Table: Explanatory Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explanatory Variables</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t-statistic</th>
<th>Explanatory Variables</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t-statistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.440</td>
<td>10.23</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.193</td>
<td>4.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AREA</td>
<td>-.052</td>
<td>-2.60</td>
<td>AREA</td>
<td>-.050</td>
<td>-2.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDU</td>
<td>.008</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>CEDU</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>1.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cage</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>Cage</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>2.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PRI</td>
<td>.437</td>
<td>8.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F statistic</td>
<td>6.889 (df) = 03</td>
<td>R² = 0.049</td>
<td>F statistic</td>
<td>26.42 (df) = 04</td>
<td>R² = 0.211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted R²</td>
<td>0.042 Sample size N = 401</td>
<td></td>
<td>Adjusted R²</td>
<td>0.20 Sample size N = 401</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: Model with mediating variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explanatory Variables</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t-statistic</th>
<th>Explanatory Variables</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t-statistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.351</td>
<td>5.90</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.212</td>
<td>3.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHARM</td>
<td>.078</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>PHARM</td>
<td>-.014</td>
<td>-0.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATTACH</td>
<td>.032</td>
<td>.072</td>
<td>CATTACH</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>.035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNRVAL</td>
<td>.036</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>PNRVAL</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRVAL</td>
<td>.164</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>PRVAL</td>
<td>.101</td>
<td>2.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PRI</td>
<td>.424</td>
<td>8.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F statistic</td>
<td>4.697 (df) = 04</td>
<td>R² = 0.044</td>
<td>F statistic</td>
<td>18.16 (df) = 05</td>
<td>R² = 0.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted R²</td>
<td>0.034 Sample size N = 401</td>
<td></td>
<td>Adjusted R²</td>
<td>0.18 Sample size N = 401</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
significant impact on their religiosity this may be due to the fact that females are generally home bound and less inclined to go outside hence area of residence has little to do with their religiosity. Similarly age factor is not as much important for females because females have no economic opportunity cost of time allocation for religious activities and practices as against their male counterpart hence age is more important factor in the determination of the religiosity of the males.

The variables of home environment have greater importance for the females as they use to spend most of their time in home so these variables may cast greater impact on the religiosity of the females. In this study the variable of parental religious harmony is significant with positive sign showing that a one percent rise in the religious understanding between parents increases females religiosity by 0.115 percent keeping all other factors constant. This finding of our study is in line with the findings of Lehrer and Chiswick (1993), Hoge & Petrillo, (1978). If we compare the findings of this variable with that of males model we see that parental religious denomination is not as much important for the religiosity of the males as it is for females net of all the other factors. Similarly the variable of child attachment which is relating to the parent child understating and affection is also significant with positive sign. No doubt this variable is important for the transmission of religiosity from parents to child because it indicates how better children can communicate their problems to their parents and how better parents can understand the needs of their children. If we compare the findings of this variable with that of the male’s model we see that it is not significant although it appear with positive sign. It means that for males the parent child attachment is not an important factor in the transmission of religiosity.

The variable of parental tolerance of non religious values observed at home is also significant with appropriate negative sign showing that if the non religious environment at home increases by one percent the religiosity of the females’ decreases by 0.068 percent, net of all other factors. If we compare the findings of this variable with that of the findings of male data it is observed that neither it is significant nor its sign is appropriate according to hypothesis. This might be because females are under parental control whereas males’ may no longer observe the parental control for non-religious activities. It means even if parents themselves don’t practice religion but have authority to control for non-religious environment at home it can positively impact the religiosity of females. The most important among the entire home environment variables is the parental control for the observance of religious practices at home and outside. This variable appears to be significant with positive sign showing that parental control is an important determinant of the child’s religiosity. The same findings are observed for the male sample of our study confirming the hypothesis of the study that greater authoritarianism of the parents results in greater observance of religious practices by the children.

The extended model with home environment variables includes parental religious traits as an additional predictor to make a comprehensive analysis of intergenerational transmission. The overall significance of the model shown by F-statistic improves a lot from 6.17 to 11.93 confirming the hypothesis of the study that
Does Religious Capital Transmit Across the Generations? A Gender Based Evidence From Multan District

parental religious characteristics are unique in the determination of the religiosity of their children. The coefficient of the variable is highly significant with coefficient value 0.382. If we compare the result of this variable with that of male data we find same result but with a little bit lower value of the coefficient.

The important thing that is seen in the extended model with mediating variables is that the coefficient of the parental control variable for religious values (PRVAL) turns out to be insignificant with positive sign which speaks out that females’ take inspiration from parental religious practices and not by parental authority to observe religious values. Whereas the parental control of non religious values (PNRVAL) turns out to be significant with negative sign propounding that if parents’ increases control for the non religious environment along with their own observance of religious practice at home will cause positive impact on the religiosity of females. If we compare the result of this coefficient with that of the males sample it is seen that the coefficients for males is not significant when parental religious characteristics are included in the model.

Another important change that has occurred in the model after the inclusion of the parental religious characteristics is that the variables of parental religious harmony and the variable of child attachment have become insignificant but their signs remained positive. It means for the female’s sample of this study the parental religious practices (PRI) along with the parental control of non-religious home environment are more important for the transmission of religious traits from parents to child even than there is no parent-child attachment and religious denominational harmony. The same findings are obtained for the male sample but with the combination of parental control for the observance of religious practices at home rather non-religious practices which might be due to the fact that it is more difficult to control for the males non-religious activities due to their greater outdoor activities where for females it is possible to that extent.

Table 7.8 Religious Transmission: Partial Analysis for Female

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explanatory variables</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Un-standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standard error</th>
<th>t-statistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.272</td>
<td>.048</td>
<td>5.643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRI</td>
<td>.427</td>
<td>.435</td>
<td>.064</td>
<td>6.847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F statistic = 46.880</td>
<td>(d.f) = 01</td>
<td>R² = 0.182</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AREA</td>
<td>- .051</td>
<td>-1.21</td>
<td>-.018</td>
<td>-4.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDU</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>.167</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cage</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>1.65</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>1.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.425</td>
<td>6.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F statistics= 1.578</td>
<td>(df) = 03</td>
<td>R² = 0.02</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adjusted R² = 0.179 Sample Size N = 212
7.4 Conclusion:

This study has made a thorough analysis of the process of the intergenerational transmission of religious capital. Multi stage regression techniques have been employed to thrash out this link by adding and replacing number of appropriate variables to avoid specification bias. In spite of some data constraints, this study has made important additions to the earlier studies in numerous aspects. Firstly, in contrast to the studies conducted in west, this study uses practices and not beliefs as a proxy for gauging ones religiosity. Practicing religion produces religious capital and just having belief in religious tenets is relating to spiritual capital. Hence this study focuses on religious and not spiritual capital. Secondly, a composite index of seven religious practices with a blend of both compulsory and optional ones is used for both the parents and their offspring in this study. Thirdly, for home environment variables the observance of veil for females and attendance of congregational prayers for males are taken in this study. The results of this study for all the models discussed above, strongly endorse the hypotheses of the study that parental religious traits greatly influence the religious characteristics of their children. However the findings of the model with mediating and control variables have varying influences on the religiosity of the children. All the zero order regressions analysis strongly supports the underlying hypothesis. Similarly the results of all the extended models containing parental religious characteristics have also strengthened the findings of the zero order regression models.

The findings for the Area and children education on religiosity of offspring have been significant for male’s data but for females it was not found to be significant for both the un-extended and extended models. The impact of age has been found to be significant on religiosity of the offspring for all the models except for female. The findings of the variable of child attachment and parental harmony have been found to be significant for un-extended female model. The variable of parental sharing of non religious values has been found to be significant only for the female’s sample. However, the sharing of religious values by the parents has found to be significant in all the models except for extended female’s model.

In short, the role of the mediating variables has not found to be significant in both the extended and un-extended models for males whereas for females they have
Does Religious Capital Transmit Across the Generations? A Gender Based Evidence From Multan District

significantly influenced the religiosity of the offspring. However when variable of parental religious characteristics has been added in all the models, majority of the home environment variables have turned out to be insignificant. It shows that it is the parental religious characteristics and not the home environment variables alone which are the core determinants of the religiosity of their children. Nevertheless, looking at the overall trend from estimation, no significant difference has been found in the transmission of religiosity from parents to offspring for female and male sample. Hence the general findings of our study confirm the hypothesis of the intergenerational transmission of religiosity.

References:


---

1 See Hunsberger (1985).

2 With the exception of a few studies which used church attendance as a proxy of religious practice. The details of such are given in the review of literature of this study.

3 The variable of age has also been used with its square value in regression but none of the square of age variable has been found to be significant so excluded from all the tables.