A HISTORICAL ANALYSIS OF THE MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION CONTROVERSY IN PAKISTAN

Dr. Mohammad Nadeem
Lecturer in Education, Government S.E. College
Bahawalpur

Saira Maqbool,
Assistant Professor, Department of English &Literature,
Allama Iqbal Open University Bahawalpur.

Dr. Ammar Haider Zaidi,
Assistant Professor,
Department of Arabic
Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan

Abstract

One of the factors credited to the poor performance of students in Pakistan is the medium of instruction used at primary level. This study presents a short examination of the language in education circumstance in Pakistan from its recorded point of view. Language strategy issue in essential instruction in Pakistan has not been sufficiently tended to by the different education commissions set up by various governments. Numerous commissions have been set up to investigate the issues being looked by students and educators. Pakistan is a nation with in excess of 70 living languages and its administration is befuddled which language to choose as MOI (medium of guideline) at essential /primary level i.e. Urdu which is the national language of Pakistan and a symbol of our integrity or one of the local languages because having education in the mother tongue is one of the basic human rights. The situated is more aggravated by the importance of English language. This paper explores the MOI controversy in Pakistan. This discussion contains language controversy from the pre-Pakistan time (1835-1947) till today in numerous political
regimes to recognize the reasons of variance upon the selection of a single MOI in education.

Introduction
One of the fuming issues in many developing countries is the selection language of instruction to be used in the education system although English is uniformly accepted as the international language of the world\(^1\). The debate is to accept any vernacular or a lingua franca as the medium of instruction\(^2\). Pakistan is a multilingual nation. In excess of 70 languages are spoken in the diverse areas of Pakistan. Six indigenous significant languages exists i.e. Urdu, Sindhi, Sariaki, Punjabi, Pashto, and Baluchi whereas national language Urdu is also the official language but the inherited colonial language is also the official language since its independence. Eisenchlas, Schalley and Guillemin while expressing the importance of mother tongue as medium of instruction says that mother tongue has been preferred as medium of instruction in many developed countries \(^3\). But situation in Pakistan is different. The Siraiki, Brahui and Hindko are likewise utilized as a part of various districts of the country. Medium of instructions contention in Pakistan has occurred since autonomy\(^4\). Amid British lead, on the issue of medium of instruction, the decision elites were divided in two camps. First one was Orientalists, the supporters of vernaculars whereas the second was Anglicists, who were the backer of English language to be utilized as medium of instructions. The matter of language as the medium of instructions is still uncertain. Khursheed expressed his worry that the issue of the medium of instructions in Pakistan has been brought up in various gatherings of instruction and arrangements of educational policies \(^5\) now and then i.e. from the main tradition on instruction in 1947 to the last educational policy in the year 2009.
Historical summary

Medium of Instruction Controversy in Pre-partition Time (1835-1947)
Medium of instruction debate isn't another point of dialog for the experts however it doesn't mark it less basic. The concern on medium of instruction initially showed up in Indo-Pak when Governor Generalship was in the hands of Lord William Bentick. Under the solid impact of Auglistis, British ruler imposed English by eliminating the Persian as medium of instruction in indo Pak by weighting from numerous Anglicists like Trevelyon and Macaly in 1835.

In 1850 another detectable improvement in a similar regard occurred when the Wood's Dispatch 1854 presented the strategy of training western Education in English language as it were. It was a similar strategy that was embraced by the Education Commission in 1883. The following advancement in such manner came in 1904 when in a gathering held in Shimla Lord Cuzon featured the significance of vernacular language. It was the initial step at any point taken by any Britisher in such manner 6.

The neighborhood individuals who were agreeable to vernacularisation couldn't stand firm as they were at that point isolated into two camps; one was supporting Urdu as substitution of English whereas second was agreeable to Hindi. This issue was resolved on Council's request by the Governor General through of choosing vernaculars the Language of Education 7. It put a conclusion to the argument from the general population who upheld English comprising Sir E. Persy of Bombey station. Jervise's contention against English was that making English the language of Education will thoroughly segregate the Anglicized from the locals.

Controversy after independence regarding Medium of instructions (1947-1971)
In self-governing Pakistan, government was framed by the pioneers of Muslim League. They connected Urdu language with religious and Pakistani atmosphere. The government of Pakistan reflected that no other language but Urdu could be
Saira Maqbool, Ammar Haider Zaidi & Mohammad Nadeem

accustomed to bond the differing ethnic group of Pakistan. Thus, proclaimed the uni-national felt that urdu is choosed as national language of Pakistanis of being one nation. No recognizable insurance was seen to this methodology decision in the excitement for Pakistan. In 1947, Educational conference at Karachi, the minister of Education remarked that Pakistan should not dispose of a language (English) that may give us so regular access to each one of the favored bits of knowledge of western science and culture.

It was recommended in 1948 by the Board of Education that Urdu must be the tongue of rule at all levels of education yet principles could not established concerning private English medium schools by the board (Rahman). Later on, Governor of Punjab in 1949 established an association on the name of Official Language Committee, with the proposal to coin new vocabulary; furthermore schools were directed to convert from English to Urdu.

As indicated by the CNE report the status of Sindhi was influenced by the administration's support of Urdu language. As indicated by The Report on National Education, Urdu was specified an indistinguishable status in Sindh from in whatever remains of West Pakistan. It implied that Sindhi as a medium of guideline was supplanted by Urdu.

An unified front of East Bengal was established for contesting first election in Pakistan. This group recommended (21) focuses principles in which idea No. 10 of this principle looked for the presentation of vernaculars as a medium of instruction. (Islam,) So Urdu turned into the medium of instruction in essential and center schools in West Pakistan. As per the enumeration directed in 1951, even where English, Urdu, Sindhi, or Pushto was accomplished educational activities as the second language. In this matter, people who could write at all, write Urdu in West Pakistan.

The Punjab language committee replaced English language as medium of instructions with Urdu in 1949. Auxiliary instruction was at that point conferred in Urdu. Around then it was additionally recommended that Urdu should come about of English even in Higher education. Notwithstanding, disregarding the accord that Urdu ought to supplant English, elitist schools for example, cadet universities continued.
prospering especially after Ayub Khan's burden of military law. When he was filling in as a general even around then his proposal was to begin open establishments for the preparation of educated people to getting to be prospect officers. He framed a Commission on Education recognized as Sharif Commission. The commission legitimately defended said tip top schools by the renewal.

Choice of medium of instruction for any nation is a political issue. Same is the situation with Pakistan however as quite a bit of our leading class has a place with world class gathering, they maintain their own benefits. As indicated by these may incorporate expansion of forces, offices for the exclusive class, administering for ages, country structure as per once thoughts and collusion of numerous ethnic meetings.

Ayub's Education design accentuated English and Urdu as major Languages of Pakistan, however it prescribed that Arabic ought to likewise be a language of guideline (Rahman). Similarly, in Pakistan we have had numerous identities which upheld English as medium, one of them was the leader of Pakistan Atomic Energy Commission in 1960s. In a meeting of the Scientific Society he featured a few explanations because of which Urdu was abandoned and for science subjects could not replace as language of instruction. In spite of the fact that Dr. Saleemul Zaman Siddiqui, the widely acclaimed's researcher, had differ prior and had favored Urdu with the end goal of instruction, numerous researchers concurred with Dr. Usmani and the problem was later chattered at a chancellors' meeting.

In 1969 to revamp the instructive framework Yahya's administration instituted a board of trustees. This advisory group under the chairmanship of Air Marshal Nur Khan prescribed that English ought not to persist in Pakistan. Rather, Urdu and Bengali should succeed it by 1975. The new instructive arrangement proposal issued through Nur Khan during the government of Yahya Khan prescribed Urdu in the West Pakistan and Bengali as the medium of instruction in the East Pakistan.
Medium Of instruction controversy after the separation
East Pakistan (1971-2015)

a) Period of Pakistan People’s Party
It was the government of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto (1971–1977), who was a strong supporter of English Language. Two political parties were in opposition to the Bhuto’s government i.e. Jamiat-e- Ulema-i-Islam and the National Awami Party. Both these parties were the supporters of Urdu language. As Bhutto was not in favor to give any support to Urdu so that his opponents created propaganda against him. In fact his opponents used to conduct open discussions against him in conferences at public areas. 17. Pakistan Peoples’ Party (PPP) controlled the nation within 1970s. It was the administration of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto (1971–1977), who was a strong follower of English Language. Two political gatherings were contrary to the Bhuto’s administration i.e. the Jamiat-e-Ulema-I-Islam and National Awami Party. Both these gatherings were the supporters of Urdu. Bhutto at no time offered ample significance to Urdu that would have implied advancing his rivals so that influenced Urdu to campaign against him. Taint in Urdu meetings there used to be an open level headed discussion in contradiction of Bhutto and PPP 18.

Due to these exercises on part of the administration and the restriction relating the predominance of one dialect over other, there was much distress among the students. The Hamood ur Rahman Commission, arranged to explore reasons for students distress, scrutinized universities which had received Urdu as a medium of examination in BA, and it guarded the discriminatory schools on an indistinguishable reasons from the 1959 report 19.

b) Zia Ul Haq Regime
Amid Gen. Zia Ul Haq’s military duration (1977– 1988), the conventional, campaign of Urdu started, and also encouraged by General Zia, who used the teachings of Islam and urdu language as descriptions of Muslim and Pakistani identity. Zia formulated the National Language Authority in 1979 and plead with Urdu as the medium of instructions in all schools.
Gen. Zia approved a demand regarding Urdu as medium of instruction in schools throughout the country from the year 1979 onwards beginning from class 1. The 1979 Education approach recommended a few methodologies to accomplish this national objective of General Zia. One of the systems contrived by the Commission was the presentation of Urdu as a medium of instructions. In this manner, it chose that from the year 1989, the registration in examination would conduct in Urdu. Nonetheless, prior the superior English-version schools could have been canceled, Zia was persuaded to alter his opinion, and a few schools were allowed consent to proceed as English medium. As far back as the medium of instruction remained same in leading schools despite the fact that regardless of many years of fair legislature of Pakistan.

c) Benazir, Nawaz and Musharraf Regimes
In Benazir’s two placements (1988–1990 and 1993–1996) and a short time later too there have been two schools of thought, the radical who maintains English as an essential Language and the fundamentalist who incline toward Urdu over English. In 1990 Use of Mother tongue Use Bill in Baluchistan was passed by Benazir Bhutto's administration. It made Baluchi, Brahvi and Pashto compulsory in government schools just exempting the tip top schools which kept English as medium of instruction. In Benazir's two positions (1988–1990 and 1993–1996) and a brief span later as well there was two schools of thoughts. First one was the radical who keeps up English as a basic Language second was the fundamentalist who slant with reference to Urdu over English. In this regime, a bill was passed from the Baluchistan assembly in 1990 regarding the use of Mother tongue Use Bill. Through this bill, Pashto, Brahvi and Baluchi, were allowed as medium of instructions in schools excepting the leading schools which were allowed to kept reserve English language as medium of instructions. In any case, by and by this bill was never actualized as no course readings were created and no expert instructor preparing was given to the teachers.
Conclusion

English was introduced in the education by the Britishers (1857-1947). English was made the way to join the civil services. The purpose behind this step was to create a class of people who would share the same interests as the rulers. Even after the Britishers left, they left this legacy behind and this system continued even after independence in 1947. The elite class made this possible. English medium schools were established for the rich and Urdu medium for the poor masses. After independence Urdu was considered to be the unifying power of the nation. The nationalist has a strong desire to unify the nation by one language. But instead of promoting the national unity, it became a source of disintegration and the declaration of Urdu as the national language made East Pakistan to become independent in 1971. But the problem was still not resolved. In the constitution of 1973 Urdu was selected as the official language and it was decided that within fifteen years, it would replace English. English would only be considered as de facto official language until then. It was decided that the reason behind this controversy was the dilemma of this situation. It has been around forty three years instead of fifteen since that constitution even still the situation is the same. The nation is still divided between two i.e. the elite and the poor and so is our education system and English is still the power of the elite.

The situation is still the same created by the Britishers i.e. of colonizers and colonizeds. English still exists in the system for those who can afford it and Urdu and local languages for those who cannot. Such education system is a strong distributor of power and privileges in Pakistan. On one hand Pakistan has proved its commitment to Urdu by introducing Urdu in all the public schools but on the other hand the rulers are ambitious to provide access to English education to all. This is a two dimensional planning, in the two opposite directions. This is the reason that we have yet not been able to implement an effective system of education. The Education Policy of 2009 has declared the promotion of English in the government schools.

Pakistan’s population according to the World Bank Report 2012 is 176745364. Amongst these one third is below age 15.
Eight half is below age 20. Two third is under age 30. It makes half of Pakistan’s population of the school going age. Economically as well the society is scattered. On one hand 60% of the population earns less than 2$ a day and on the other hand 10% of the residents receives more than quarter of the whole state’s income. The reason behind this divide is to some extent our educational policy inherited from the Britishers. Multilingual identity of the nation should be acknowledged in education. 70 different languages are spoken in Pakistan. Only 7% of among the population used Urdu as mother tongue. Making it the language of education at primary level will make 93% of the population deprived of having education in the mother tongue. Young learners from rural areas are particularly facing hurdles in this regard. They cannot even understand Urdu language, talking about English at primary level seems only a dream. In Pakistan, just 60% of kids finish early school and just 10% complete secondary school, while 59% of young ladies go to elementary school contrasted with 73% of young men. Over 70% of populace lives in rural regions. It is proposed that Education at primary level should be introduced in the local language with Urdu being taught as a subject only. It will lead to low drop out rats. English can be introduced in schools as a subject in elementary level and later on English medium education can be introduced at higher level.
References


17 S Abdullah, Pakistan Mein Urdu KaMasla(The Problem of Urdu in Pakistan) (Lahore: Khiaban-e-Adab, 1976); G Zulfiqar and N Akhtar, Qaumi Zaban Ke Bare Men Ahem Dastavezat, 1 and 2 (Islamabad: Muqaddra Qaumi Zaban, 1986).
18 Abdullah, Pakistan Mein Urdu KaMasla(The Problem of Urdu in Pakistan); Zulfiqar and Akhtar, Qaumi Zaban Ke Bare Men Ahem Dastavezat.